

Infallibility of the Prophets (Part I)

Infallibility of the Prophets (Part I)

Introduction

This article deals with the contention of whether or not the prophets and the messengers of Allah are infallible (sinless). In Part 1, we will examine the Sunni point of view, and then we will present the Shia opinion on the matter with reference to the verses of Quran. In Part 2, we will provide logical reasoning behind the issue of the infallibility. In addition, we look at some of the authentic Sunni traditions in support of the infallibility. In Part 3, we respond to the arguments of the opponents in this regard.

Is it possible for a human being to be sinless? Is it realistic to believe that Allah (SWT), the Creator and Sustainer of the Universe, would send forth a sinful man to guide mankind? What about the Quran, what information and evidence about the matter does it provide? These are the questions, among others, that the article at hand is attempting to answer.

Disclaimer

The Twelver Shi'ites do NOT hold ANY human being, whether he be a prophet, a messenger, or an Imam, to be divine. We do not worship human beings, nor do we approve of such a custom. Allah (SWT) is never compromised in Shi'ite theology or philosophy! All the negative stuff you may hear about us is pure propaganda with political motives. Allah (SWT) is Exalted above all that scratches dignity and justice. We hold Allah (SWT) to be the JUST Creator (SWT), Who never commits any injustice against His creation. Allah (SWT) is indivisible, and He does not relinquish His (SWT) Majesty and Sovereignty to anyone. No one is permitted to interfere with His Wishes, except by His leave. This is the Authentic Twelver Shi'ite Creed, and everything else that is negative in nature, and is attributed to the Shia, is crap.

Infallibility According to the Sunnis

The Sunni scholars do not speak in one voice on this subject. Some Sunnis claim that the Prophet(S.A.W.) is sinless or infallible ONLY in the delivery of Allah's message. Other than that, he(S.A.W.), just like others, sins and makes mistakes in many things.

This faction of Sunnis base their opinion on the traditions narrated in their books about how the Prophet(S.A.W.) falls asleep and forgets the prayer time, and even forgets to perform the necessary ablution (Wudu) for prayer (Sahih al-Bukhari, Arabic version, v1, p37,44,171). Furthermore, they claim that he(S.A.W.) used to sit with Aisha and watch a dance with music (Sahih al-Bukhari, Arabic version, v3, p228). They also claim that he(S.A.W.) was affected by a magical spell that caused severe episodes of hallucination on his part (Sahih al-Bukhari, Arabic version, v7, p29; and v4, p68). These are but a FEW of the most heinous of acts that these "scholars" attribute to the Mercy to Mankind, the Messenger of Allah, Muhammad(S.A.W.).

Note that according to the Shia, these traditions are NOT authentic, nor do they constitute ANY truth whatsoever. Again, these traditions were inserted into their books by the Umayyad, among others, to justify their own corruption and insolence. For when the Prophet(S.A.W.) sins so heinously as they depict him(S.A.W.) in the above traditions, we can no longer blame Uthman, or Muawiyah, or Yazid, or Amr Ibn al-Aas, among others, when they sin. It is to their advantage to portray the Prophet(S.A.W.) as a man who listens to music and watches a dance with his wife, to justify the dancing and the music that was (and still is) rampant in their palaces.

The current state of the Ummah is NOT because a few of us aren't praying or fasting,; it is because some people have CHANGED and MUTILATED the religion of Allah (SWT) to satisfy their lusts, just like the Christians and Jews did. That's exactly what we have fallen into. We sin, then we say: so what -- the Prophet(S.A.W.) himself was a sinner! Purified be the prophets and messengers of Allah (SWT) from being of such a sinful nature! By Allah, to say such a thing is more of an insult to Allah, than it is to the prophet and messengers. Because when we assert that Allah sends forth sinful men, we are claiming that Allah (SWT) Himself approves of sin; or why, then, would he send forth a sinful man? Yet, on the other hand, Allah (SWT) forbids us from doing evil! What kind of twisted logic is this? Exalted be Allah (SWT) from such an insult!

Infallibility According to the Shia

The Shia, on the other hand, state that ALL the prophets and messengers of Allah, with NO exception, are sinless and infallible, even before they became prophets and messengers. For instance, although Prophet Muhammad(S.A.W.) became Messenger at the age of forty, the Shia assert that even in the first forty years of his life, he was sinless and infallible -- an assertion that history attests to as well.

It is indeed frustrating to conceive of a human being who is NOT sinful. So, let us first define the concept of infallibility:

The Concept of Infallibility

According to the scholar Muhammad Jawad Mughniyah (May Allah rest his soul in peace), in his book "al-Islam Wa al-'Aql -- Islam and Reason," the concept of Ismah (Infallibility) is very often misunderstood. What we mean by that concept is that a prophet, by virtue of his

prophethood, has a pure soul. As the Quran states:

"...the (human) soul certainly incites evil, UNLESS my lord do bestow His Mercy... (12:53)"

Clearly Allah (SWT) has made an exception (by using the term "UNLESS") to the human soul that incites evil. We can understand, based on Shi'ite philosophy, that the attachment of the soul (Nafs) to being is that of a relationship of control and administration. Therefore, the soul may incite evil; but the individual has the freedom and the authority to reject that invitation to evil. If the individual accepts the invitation to evil, he becomes accountable for that evil which he commits. This is a very simplified explanation, but it serves the purpose.

Now, the prophets or the messengers, are among the exception as Allah (SWT) has indicated. That is, there is something in the soul of these virtuous HUMANS that precludes the incitement of evil, and as such they never commit it. Their virtue is so high that they never even think of committing a sin. It is NOT that if a prophet or a messenger wanted to commit a sin, he can't; rather, it is that "Mercy," mentioned in the above verse, that is bestowed upon him from Allah (SWT) that precludes him from doing so. As such, he is sinless and infallible even though they have full ability of committing any kind of sin.

When Satan refused to prostrate to Adam, He was driven away and became an accursed one. Quran states that thereupon Satan said:

15:39

He said: My Lord, Because You has sent me astray, verily I shall adorn the path of error for them on the earth, and shall deceive them all.

15:40

Except those of them who are Your perfectly devoted Servants.

15:41

(Allah) said: "This (Way of My sincere servants) is indeed a Way that leads straight to Me.

15:42

Lo! as for My slaves, you have NO way into them except the wrong-doers who follow you.

15:43

And verily for all such people, hell is the promised place.

It is clear from the above conversation that Allah has promised that Satan has NO WAY into His sincere Servants, and only wrong-doers will follow the Satan. Thus the Sincere Servants of Allah are not wrong-doers and shall not be deceived. Also Allah confirms that the Path of His Sincere Servants is a path which leads straight to Him. All these facts prove that the Sincere Servants of Allah never fall into the trap of Satan, and as such they are infallible, due to Allah's Mercy.

One side remark here is that there is no mention of "prophet" or "messenger" in the above verses. In other words, the "perfectly devoted Servants" who are infallible are not necessarily "prophets" or "messengers". The issue of the infallibility of the Imams will be discussed in a separate article, however.

The Quran Speaks About the Prophets

First, it would be of help to take a look at the commandment of obeying the messenger, to see how all-encompassing and all-pervading this commandment is, and how great the authority of the messenger of Allah is. Allah states in Quran:

"And we did not send any messenger, unless he should be obeyed by Allah's authority." (Quran 4:64)

The prophet or the messenger of God is to be obeyed and followed; the followers ARE NOT EXPECTED TO CHECK EVERY ORDER OF THE PROPHET to decide what is to be obeyed and what is not to be obeyed. There is no way to check his commands, because he himself gave us all the rules and his divine laws in the form of Scripture and his traditions (sayings/actions/satisfactions). If we become suspicious to some of the actions of the prophet, this suspicion can cause all his commands and laws that he has already conveyed to go under question. This shows that the prophets and messengers were free from error and sin; otherwise Allah would not have ordered people to obey them UNCONDITIONALLY.

There are many verses in which Allah commands us to obey the prophet:

"O you who believe! Obey Allah, and obey the Messenger and do not burn your deeds (by disobeying him)." (Quran 47:33)

Allah, Exalted, also states:

"Whoever obeys the Messenger, he indeed obeys Allah." (Quran 4:80)

In the above verses as well as many other verses of the Quran, obedience of Allah has become synonymous with the obedience of the prophets. Such assertion would have been impossible if the prophets were not infallible (Ma'soom). Now, note the following verse:

"...and obey not from among them a sinner or an ungrateful one." (Quran 76:24)

The picture is complete! "The prophets are to be obeyed," and "the sinners are NOT to be obeyed." The only conclusion is that the prophets were NOT sinners or wrong-doers. In other words, they were infallible (Ma'soom) and sinless.

Looking specially at the Holy Prophet of Islam(S.A.W.), Allah tells us:

"And whatever the Messenger gives you, take it; and from whatever he forbids you, keep back." (Quran 59:7)

This is another indication that WHATEVER the Prophet(S.A.W.) offered must be accepted unconditionally and with no doubt. This means that the permission or prohibition of the Holy Prophet was always in accordance with the will of Allah and was always favored by Him. It proves that the Holy Prophet was protected (Ma'soom). No one can be so sure about the commands of a man who is not infallible.

Now, if the Prophet(S.A.W.) was a sinner as some people falsely allege, then how can Allah

(SWT) order us to accept that which could be sinful? Fear Allah (SWT) in your reasoning. For those who argue that the above verse is specific ONLY to religious injunctions, and the Prophet(S.A.W.) is sinless in that matter only, I would say such assertion is baseless. This is a basic rule that to the time that there is no exclusion or condition or particularization has been mentioned in conjunction with a text of Quran, it covers all aspects. Second, EVERYTHING the Prophet(S.A.W.) spoke had something to do with Allah (SWT) and His religion; then how can you claim that Allah (SWT) is making a separation? Haven't you heard what Aisha said when she was asked about the Prophet's behavior? She said: "His life was the Quran, especially the first ten verses of the Chapter al-Noor, the Light." Now, if the Prophet's(S.A.W.) life was the Quran verbatim, how can he(S.A.W.) be a sinner? That means that the Quran is full of sinful things! Exalted be Allah (SWT) from revealing such a book!!! There is another verse in which Allah said:

"(O prophet) tell (people) If you really love Allah, then follow me, Allah will love you and forgive you your sins." (Quran 3:31)

Here the love of Allah is made contingent on following the orders of the Prophet of Islam. Both sides of love are included in it. If you love Allah follow the Prophet; if you follow the Prophet, Allah will love you. Does it not show that the Prophet was absolutely free from any type of blemish?

Not only the orders of the Prophet, but also all his decisions are protected from error for Allah said to his Prophet:

But no by thy Lord! They can have no (real) Faith until they make thee judge in ALL disputes between them and find in their souls no resistance against thy decisions but accept them with the fullest conviction. (Quran 4:65)

If ALL the decisions of the Prophet should be accepted unconditionally, then the Prophet should be protected from error in ALL his decisions.

Beside his actions and his decisions, even any single word of his speeches was the Commands of Allah. Almighty states in the Quran:

53:1

By the Star when it sets,

53:2

Your companion (i.e., Prophet) does not err/wander, nor is he deceived

53:3

Nor does he speak out of his desire;

53:4

It is no less than a revelation that is revealed.

53:5

The Mighty in Power has taught him.

The above verses not only proves that the Prophet did not err or sin, but also testifies that all his speeches were revelation (either directly or indirectly). These verses unequivocally clears the Messenger of Allah(S.A.W.) from EVER saying ANYTHING of his(S.A.W.) own desire. That includes his(S.A.W.) tradition and the Quran. For those who argue otherwise, don't forget that the tradition is used in ANY interpretation of the Quran; and in matters of Jurisprudence (Fiqh), as well as in other areas. If the tradition is corrupt because you claim that the Prophet(S.A.W.) is a sinner (May Allah forgive us!!), then the interpretation of the Quran is also corrupt!!! Fear Allah (SWT) in your reasoning! For those who claim that the Prophet(S.A.W.) is sinless in the delivery of the Message of Allah (SWT), and that includes the Hadith, then you have already admitted what the Shia say!!! It is unanimously agreed that the Sunnah of the Prophet covers the Prophet's sayings, actions, and thought/satisfaction. Since the Sunnah are reflections of the Prophet's actions, he(S.A.W.) is then sinless in the actions as well.

Allah also said:

"Have We not caused thy bosom to dilate? And removed from thee thy burden? That which weighed down thy back? And exalted the esteem (in which) thou (art held)?..." (Quran 94:1-4)

I will not personally comment on the above verse, but here's what Abdullah Yusuf Ali, a Sunni translator of the Quran, has to say in his footnotes to the verse:

"(This is also) the prayer of Moses (asking for the expansion of the breast). The breast is symbolically the seat of knowledge and the highest feelings of love and affection, the treasure-house in which are stored the jewels of that quality of human character which approaches nearest to the divine. The holy Prophet's human nature had been PURIFIED, EXPANDED, and ELEVATED, so that he became a Mercy to all Creation. Such a nature could afford to ignore the lower motives of ordinary humanity which caused shameful attacks to be made on him. Its strength and courage could also bear the burden of the galling work which it had to do in DENOUNCING SIN, SUBDUING IT, and protecting Allah's (SWT) creatures from its oppression.

It is indeed a grievous and galling burden for a man to fight single-handed against sin. But Allah sends HIS GRACE and aid, and THAT BURDEN IS REMOVED, or converted into joy and triumph in the service of the One True God.

The Prophet's virtues, the magnanimity of his character, and his love for mankind were fully recognized in his lifetime, and his name stands highest among the heroic leaders of mankind. The phrase used here is more comprehensive in meaning that used for various prophets..."

[End of quote from A. Yusuf Ali]

Do I need to say more? Let us see if Allah said any more:

"It is He who has sent His Messenger with the GUIDANCE and the Religion of Truth..."
(Quran 9:33)

"And the unbelievers say: Why is not a Sign sent down to him from his Lord? But thou art truly a warner and for EVERY nation there exists a GUIDE." (Quran 13:7)

A Messenger, who rehearses to you the Signs of Allah containing clear explanations, in order to lead forth those who believe and do righteous deeds from the depths of Darkness into Light." (Quran 65:11)

The above verses of Quran testify that the Prophet Muhammad(S.A.W.) was a Guide sent to lead forth people from the depths of Darkness into Light. (65:11) And that he(S.A.W.) is a warner (27:91) and one of the guides for people. (13:7). Sin is darkness, and as such, how can the Prophet was sent to move people from darkness into light when he himself is sitting in the darkness?! May Allah protect us from slandering His Prophet(S.A.W.).

Similarly Quran informs us that the Prophet has come to us to sanctify and cleanse us and to teach us wisdom:

As We have sent unto you a messenger from among you who recites unto you Our revelations and cleanses you, and teaches you the Scripture and wisdom, and teaches you that which you knew not. (Quran 2:151)

Allah did bestow a great favor unto the believers when He sent among them an Messenger from among themselves reciting unto them the Signs of Allah sanctifying them and teaching them the Scripture and Wisdom while before that they had been in manifest error. (Quran 3:164)

See also Quran 2:129, 62:2 which also testify that one of the missions of the Prophet(S.A.W.) was to cleanse the true believers. Then how could a prophet purify others of wrong-doings if he himself were not pure? How could Allah send an impure and sinful person to cleanse others? How could a man teach others wisdom if he had no wisdom to distinguish right from wrong; or worst still, if he had no willpower to resist from doing wrong? The Prophet was to teach people the Book of Allah; this means that he KNEW the Commandment of Allah. He was to purify them and teach them wisdom. This means he himself had wisdom and purity.

Witness to the perfection of his character is found in Quran where Allah states:

"And most certainly you are on sublime morality (exalted standard of character)." (Quran 68:4)

A man committing mistakes does not deserve such compliments. All these verses clearly prove two things:

1.

The authority of the Holy Prophet upon the believers was unlimited and all-comprehensive. Any order given by him, under any condition, in any place, at any time, was to be obeyed unconditionally.

2.

Supreme authority was given to him because he was sinless (Ma'soom) and free from all types of errors and sins. Otherwise, Allah would not have ordered us to obey him with no questioning or doubt.

End of Part 1 of 3

Infallibility of the Prophets (Part II)

In this part, we discuss the logical support for the infallibility of the Prophets, and we then provide some traditions from Sahih al-Bukhari and Sahih al-Tirmidhi with regard to the issue of infallibility.

Reason and Logic

Apart from the analysis of the character of a prophet historically or as a character from the Quran, such character can also be judged within the confines of reason and logic. As such, the obvious question is: Is it rational and/or realistic for a Prophet sent by the Creator and Sustainer of the Universe to be a sinner? Let's find out:

First, when Allah (SWT) sends forth a Prophet, He (SWT) distinguishes him from all the creatures by cleansing him from evil and sin, so that he may serve as an example. Indeed, Allah (SWT) asserts: "You have indeed in the Messenger of Allah AN EXCELLENT EXEMPLAR for him who hopes in Allah and the Final Day, and who remember Allah much. (Quran 33:21)" As such, a man that has been chosen by the Creator of the Universe to represent Him (SWT) on the Earth, CANNOT be of an evil nature, nor can he be a sinner that commits ignoble acts. If the Prophet is sent to advice humanity to do good deeds, then he himself commits sins, do you believe that he will serve as an outstanding example to be followed? That would be like an Imam of Mosque who waves his right hand saying: "Don't drink beer!" while a holds a beer can in his left hand!!!

Second, if the Prophet(S.A.W.) enjoins righteousness and forbids evil when he himself is a sinner who commits evil, he has gone against what Allah said in Quran that:

O you who believe! why do you say that which you do not act? It is most hateful in the sight of Allah that you say that which you do not act. (61:2-3)

Based on the above verse of Quran, if prophet was a sinner, he should not have preached others in the first place!! As such, a sinful prophet faces a dilemma: If he does not preach, he has disobeyed the order of God who has ordered him to convey the message (Quran 5:67). On the other hand, if he preaches, he again has disobeyed God where Allah states "O you who believe! why do you say that which you do not act? It is MOST HATEFUL in the sight of Allah that you say that which you do not act.!!!"

Didn't Allah (SWT) reprimand the Jews by saying: "Do you enjoin right conduct on the

people, and forget (to practice it) yourselves, and yet you study the Scripture? Will you not understand? (Quran 2:44)" Clearly, a Prophet CANNOT order a layman to perform prayer on a timely basis, when the Prophet himself forgets to pray, and when he remembers, he prays without ablution (Wudu) (as Sahih al-Bukhari, Arabic version, v1, p123; and v1, p37)!!! Purified be the Representatives of Allah (SWT) from such false accusations!

Third, a prophet that sins is a repulsive character. We, as humans, detest a person who comes to us and says don't do this and don't do that, yet he himself commits wicked acts. He automatically becomes repulsive to us, and we cannot stand to listen to him anymore. Similarly, if Prophet Muhammad(S.A.W.) was cruel to a blind man, which he WAS NOT, how can he ask us to have good manners? (NOTE AGAIN: The blind man's story is not related to the Prophet(S.A.W.) as some Sunnis state; it was a chapter revealed to reprimand Uthman Ibn Affan, who was the one who frowned in the face of the blind man. Please see the earlier article which was exclusively in this regard).

Do you seriously believe that a Prophet of Allah (SWT) was a sinner and so offensive? Why do you follow him then? I, personally, will NOT believe in a man who claims to be sent by Allah (SWT), the Creator of the Universe, and then sins and behaves in a manner that is not even befitting of a beast!

Forth, was Allah (SWT) so incapable as to make His (SWT) prophets and messengers sinless? Why would Allah (SWT) even bother to send a sinning prophet to be an example to a community? If sin is something that even the prophets and messengers can not avoid, then what is the purpose of sending a religion to the mankind any way? Does God expect the ordinary people to follow his instructions when his own deputies can not?

Fifth, a prophet or messenger is an interpreter of Allah's commands. As such, if the prophet is the first to violate these commands, who among the Ummah will abide by these commands? Or if he is in a state that deprives him of his mental faculties causing him to err, then he will MISinterpret the commands of Allah (SWT). If that happens, then surely Allah (SWT) is playing a game with His creation! For He (SWT) sends them a man to interpret the religion for them, yet this man is subject to magical spells, as the Israelites reports claim, and mental hallucinations that cause him to become unaware of his own behavior (See Sahih Bukhari, Arabic version, v7, p29)! What kind of interpreter is that? Exalted be Allah (SWT) from such allegations against His Prophet(S.A.W.)!

sixth, for those among Sunnis who say that the Prophet(S.A.W.) is sinless or infallible ONLY in the delivery of Allah's (SWT) message, and other than that, just like any other man, he(S.A.W.) sins and makes mistakes in many things, such assertion is full of logical holes. For instance, Sunnis narrated that once the Prophet gave advice on agriculture, and people did it, but they suffered a big loss by following that advice!! Then Prophet told them that what he said was his personal advice and not revelation!!! (which is, by the way, in contradiction with the verse: "Nor does he (prophet) speak out of his desire. What he says is nothing but revelation that is revealed.[53:3-4]")

How do we know which of the Prophet's sayings are from Allah (SWT), and which are his personal sayings? He(S.A.W.) may say something which the companions take as Allah's command, but it may be that he(S.A.W.) was only expressing his OWN opinion. If that happens, then all of Allah's laws will be in chaos and disarray! That is why, even the Prophet's OPINION has to conform with Allah's orders, for fear of misinterpretation by the people. In fact the Prophet had a perfect reason and his Ijtihad was in perfect compliance with the Allah's orders and satisfaction and that is why Quran orders us to obey WHATEVER he states without condition.

Also, how can we understand which acts of the Prophet are wrong, and which are right? What is the measure for us? Isn't a part of this measure the practice of the Prophet(S.A.W.) himself? Since the practice of the Prophet(S.A.W.) is considered to be one of the sources of deriving the rules of Islam, we can NOT evaluate the Prophet's actions by the rules which are derived from his actions! As such all the actions of the Prophet should have been protected. Seventh, for the Prophet(S.A.W.) to be chosen to deliver Allah's (SWT) message (one of which was the Quran) and be himself a sinner, will cast doubt on the authenticity of the Quran. When the Prophet(S.A.W.) recites a verse from the Quran, how do we know that that verse is indeed from Allah (SWT), and not a side effect from the hallucinative episode that the Prophet(S.A.W.) was allegedly experiencing as a result of the magical spell cast upon him?! That would mean that Allah's (SWT) Book will be distorted by the same man who was sent to deliver it!

Eighth, just imagine what impossible situation would have been created if any prophet begin to exhort his followers to commit a mistake or sin. The wretched followers would be condemned to the displeasure of Allah in any case. If they obey the Prophet and commit that sin, then they have disobeyed the command given by Allah and thus are disgraced. If, on the other hand, they disobey the Prophet, they again have disobeyed the command of Allah about obeying the Prophet. So, it appears that a fallible prophet could bring nothing but disgrace and condemnation to his people.

Ninth, a punishable sin will cause sadness and depression to the soul of the believer. The believer who sincerely loves Allah (SWT) is angered and depressed by the sin he has committed. Feelings of sadness begin to roam the mind, and the believer will lose confidence many times. Feelings of doubt are evoked in the sense that the believer feels that Allah (SWT) may not support him at a certain point in time as punishment for what he has rendered. This doubt is NOT in the sense that he feels Allah (SWT) is not merciful enough to forgive him; rather, it is the doubt about what will happen if Allah ever decides to retaliate for what he has done.

With the above in mind, a prophet should NOT be a sinner, because that would entail that he loses confidence at certain stages in his mission. If doubt strikes the soul of a prophet, you can be assured that his mission is in jeopardy. Also, from a political and psychological standpoint, doubt automatically translates into disaster. On the other hand, it is a known historical fact that the Prophet(S.A.W.) never displayed any doubt in his mission, and thus he could not have been guilty of sins. Having doubt could not have only undermined his mission, but it would also have undermined his credibility among the believers.

Tenth, a Prophet is a teacher by virtue of his prophethood. If a teacher errs when he is supposed to be sent DIRECTLY by Allah (SWT) as a mercy to mankind, then he will need a more knowledgeable and a more virtuous teacher to guide him and to punish him in the case that he violates the limits of God; which means that the Prophet himself will need an unerring teacher sent by God, and so on, ad infinitum. Thus, it cannot be except that the Prophet MUST be the number one teacher and the highest in virtue among his own people, and that he be sinless and infallible to begin with.

As for the Imams (divinely appointed Caliphs), the same argument applies, but they are NOT prophets or messengers. They are, however, successors and vicegerents to the Seal of Prophethood. As such, if these Imams are to guide the Ummah of Muhammad(S.A.W.), they also must have the same qualities that the above argument illuminates. Please see the next article which is exclusively about the infallibility of Imams.

Reference to Infallibility in Sahih al-Bukhari

There is an interesting tradition in Sahih al-Bukhari which asserts that there are people who are Ma'soom (infallible/protected). The tradition clearly specifies that these people are the prophets and their successors (Caliphs). The tradition also illuminates the fact that He is Allah who gives the position of Caliphate to the Caliph which implies that the infallible Caliph is the one who is assigned by Allah, not by people. Moreover, the tradition asserts that there are good advisors/companions and bad advisors/companions for the prophets and their successors, but those who are protected by Allah will not be deceived by the evil advisors around them. Here is the tradition:

Sahih al-Bukhari Hadith: 9.306

Narrated Abu Sa'id al-Khudri:

The Prophet said, "Allah never sends a prophet or gives the Caliphate to a Caliph but that he (the Prophet or the Caliph) has two groups of advisors: A group advising him to do good and exhorts him to do it, and the other group advising him to do evil and exhorts him to do it. But the protected person (Ma'soom) is the one who is protected by Allah."

Do I need to make any comment?!

Is Any One Like Him?

The Holy Quran states that the Prophet(S.A.W.) is HUMAN being like us Human beings. The likeness between us and him is in the sense that both of us are human and both are accountable for our deeds. However there is no similarity between us and him in terms of virtue, knowledge, closeness to Allah. Allah gave him abilities and authorities which were not given to us ordinary beings. In the following traditions in Sahih al-Bukhari, the Prophet clearly stated that he is not like any of us, meaning that although he is human, we can not compare our weak and sinful soul with his:

Sahih al-Bukhari Hadith: 3.182

Narrated Anas:

The Prophet said, "Do not practice al-Wisal (fasting continuously without breaking one's fast in the evening or eating before the following dawn)." The people said to the Prophet, "But you practice al-Wisal?" The Prophet replied, "I am not like any of you, for I am given food and drink (by Allah) during the night." (Qala: Lastu Ka ahadin munkum).

Sahih al-Bukhari Hadith: 3.183

Narrated Abdullah Ibn Umar:

Allah's Apostle forbade al-Wisal. The people said(to him),"but you practice it?" He said, "I am not like you, for I am given food and drink by Allah." (Qala: Inni lastu mithlikum).

Sahih al-Bukhari Hadith: 3.184

Narrated Abu Sa'id:

That he had heard the Prophet saying, "Do not fast continuously (practice al-Wisal), and if you intend to lengthen your fast, then carry it on only till the Suhur (before the following dawn)." The people said to him, "But you practice (Al-Wisal), O Allah's Apostle!" He replied, "I am not similar to you, for during my sleep I have One Who makes me eat and drink." (Qala: Inni lastu ka Hay'atikum).

Sahih al-Bukhari Hadith: 3.185

Narrated Aisha:

Allah's Apostle forbade al-Wisal out of mercy to them. They said to him, "But you practice al-Wisal?" He said, "I am not similar to you, for my Lord gives me food and drink." (Qala: Inni lastu ka Hay'atikum)

Sahih al-Bukhari Hadith: 3.187

Narrated Abu Huraira:

The Prophet said twice, "(O you people) Be cautious! Do not practice al-Wisal." The people said to him, "But you practice al-Wisal?" The Prophet replied, "My Lord gives me food and drink during my sleep. Do that much of deeds which is within your ability."

Sahih al-Bukhari Hadith: 3.188

Narrated Abu Sa'id al-Khudri:

Allah's Apostle said, "Do not fast continuously day and night (practice al-Wisal) and if

anyone of you intends to fast continuously day and night, he should continue till the Suhur time." They said, "But you practice al-Wisal, O Allah's Apostle!" The Prophet said, "I am not similar to you; during my sleep I have One Who makes me eat and drink. It appears from these authentic Sunni evidences, among others, that the Prophet is like us ONLY in the sense that he is human being (i.e., like us, he has choice to do right or wrong and has a human flesh). Other than that, there is no similarity between his Supreme soul/virtues and ours.

Reference to Infallibility in Sahih al-Tirmidhi

In fact, the Prophet(S.A.W.) himself testified that he and his Ahlul-Bayt are sinless. Interesting to see that Messenger of Allah used the purification verse of Quran to prove his point. Ibn Abbas Narrated that:

The Messenger of Allah recited "Verily Allah intends to keep off from you every kind of uncleanness O' People of the House (Ahlul-Bayt), and purify you a perfect purification". (Quran, the last sentence of Verse 33:33) and then the Messenger of Allah said: "Thus Me and my Ahlul-Bayt are clear from sins."

Sunni reference:

- Sahih al-Tirmidhi, as quoted in:
- al-Durr al-Manthoor, by Jalaluddin al-Suyuti, v5, pp 605-606,198 under the commentary of Verse 33:33 of Quran
- Dala'il al-Nabawiyah, by al-Bayhaqi
- Others such as al-Tabarani, Ibn Mardawayh, Abu Nu'aym, etc.

Please note the word "thus" in the highlighted part of the above tradition. It means the Prophet himself is CONCLUDING that the verse MEANS Ahlul-Bayt (including himself) are sinless.

End of Part 2 of 3

Infallibility of the Prophets (Part III)

This part addresses the questions and counter arguments on this subject in the current and the previous rounds of discussions, and the responses to them.

Side Comments

A person asked how we explain the following verse of Quran considering the subject of infallibility:

"If Allah were to punish mankind for their wrong-doing (Dhulm), He would not leave on the (earth) a living creature, but He respites them to an appointed time, and when their time comes they cannot put (it) off a second nor (yet) advance (it)." (Quran 16:61)

My comment is as follows: There are different meaning for "Dhulm". Surely the prophets were not wrong-doers (Dhalim) as what we imply by "Dhulm". Let me start with a tradition from the Messenger of Allah, and then prove it by Quran.

The Messenger of Allah said: "The good deeds of the righteous people, are sins for those who are close (to Allah)."

This precious tradition means that the sin for the prophets and Imams has a different meaning than what we usually consider as sin. In their high level, they consider themselves sinful when they question themselves by saying: "I should have done more good deeds than of what I have done till now." This is while they did their best. Or "I did not worship Allah to the extent that He deserves by His Majesty." Or "I could be closer to God." These are the sort of sins to them which is much more different than what we think of as sin. Their sin is just a feeling of shyness toward the Glory of Allah.

According to his genuine nature, an advanced human being does not make any hesitation in following the path of Almighty God. In every step that he takes towards development, the greatness and grandeur of the power of the Almighty will become more obvious him, and he will look at his past from a higher level. For what he has done he will sometimes apologize, even if what he has done was his duties. That is because he now comprehends its inadequacy. He interprets his past worships as sin and does not see any value for his work when presented to the Great position of the Lord. With his elevated view, he perceives his submission to God's presence as sinful and even an action far from politeness.

The prophets and the divinely-appointed Imams have reached this point. Since they realize the Magnificence of their Lord and comprehend the position of the Life-Giver, they see themselves, their activities, and their prostrations and praises so little that they interpret the worship of that much affluence and greatness as sin, and with supplication and invocation, they ask for pardon and they hope for forgiveness. When they face the divine commandments and consider the Holy Position of the Almighty, they submit themselves to the Master. They see their action in front of the Lord as nothing, and recognize it as not suitable for praise. They hope it would be accepted by the Generosity and Majesty of the Creator, otherwise it is a sin to submit such inadequate worship to the Holy Presence of the Lord.

Those people like the Prophet Muhammad and his Ahlul-Bayt (peace be upon them all) realized the Divine position with a much wider view. Continuously upon the two wings of knowledge and action, they progressed to a higher and superior position. They were, at every moment, finding out more about the Magnificence of the Life-Giver of the world, and more about their own needs; consequently better understanding of their inadequate actions in comparison with that much Power and Greatness. To compensate for that, they confessed to their sins and asked the Lord for the permission to apologize with the excuse that they can NOT do to the extent of what Allah deserves, and with the hope that He would guide

them to a higher and superior position until they could continue their development process in order to reach the sublime morality.

Now the verse you mentioned should be understood in this context. No HUMAN could worship Allah to the extent of what Allah deserves to be worshipped. It is like one wants to pay an infinite debt by finite resources. Thus everybody is sinful and shameful in front of His Glory. The closer to God, the more shameful of your insufficient worship in front of God you are.

Let me also give you a proof from Quran that "Dhulm" for prophets has much different meaning. Allah, to whom belong Might and Majesty states in Quran:

"And when Abraham was tested by his Lord with certain commands and he fulfilled them. Then He said: Lo! I appoint you an Imam for mankind. (Abraham) said: And of my offspring (will there be Imam)? He said: My covenant does not reach the wrong-doers (among them)." (Quran 2:124).

In the above verse Allah states that the position of God-assigned leadership does not reach to a person who is "Dhalim" (wrong-doer). Now, there is no dispute that Prophet Muhammad(S.A.W.) was a divinely appointed leader and a descendant of Abraham (AS). Not only him, but also Moses, Jesus, David, Sulayman (Solomon) were also descendants of Abraham and all of them were assigned by Allah as Imam. This goes to prove that non of them were "Dhalim" (wrong-doer), otherwise the last sentence of Verse 2:124 will become untrue!

The only way to accept that there is no contradiction between the verse 2:124 and the verse you mentioned, is to accept what our Prophet said in the above mentioned tradition concerning that sin has a different meaning for those who are close to Allah. Their sins are the good deeds in our eyes!

A Muslim convert (former Catholic) stated that there is a report of David's adultery in the Old Testament. The Prophets were human. Remember that Muhammad's past and future sins were forgiven. It is not that he didn't have any. The Prophet(S.A.W.) used to ask forgiveness for himself. Clearly, that would constitute the attitude of a sinner repenting after an act of sin.

In reply to the disparaging quote about David (AS) from the Bible, I won't even dignify that statement by the Bible writers with a comment! one should know better than to quote a mutilated book!

As for the Prophet(S.A.W.) asking for forgiveness from Allah (SWT), I have just answered this few lines before and proved it by Quran and Hadith that the sin of the Prophets and Imams are much different than what we consider sin (which is punishable), and as such they will not be held accountable for that. That is why Allah informed the Prophet(S.A.W.) that his past and his future "sins" are forgiven!

If Allah (SWT) had inspired "sinful" prophets and messengers to lead people to the Right Path, it would mean that Allah (SWT) approves of sinfulness! Why then does He prohibit it? What kind of game is Allah (SWT) playing? What kind of Creator is He Who approves of something while prohibiting it at the same time? Cease and desist from insulting Allah (SWT) by claiming that His prophets and messengers were sinners. Fear Allah (SWT) O People before the day comes when you will account for your deeds! Exalted be the Merciful from these ludicrous insinuations!

A reader mentioned that Moses (AS) killed a man with his fist. What sin could be greater than killing a human?

Well, The Prophet Muhammad(S.A.W.) and Imam Ali (AS) killed many unbelievers! They did this to comply with Allah's regulations. Also killing a person during self-defense or when protecting believers from the assault of a non-believer, is not a crime.

Moreover, in many instances the sin of the prophets mentioned in Quran is the act they have committed which is considered violation by the tyrants of their time and NOT by Allah. It means that the governor considered such prophet is GUILTY of a specific act. This does NOT mean that they are guilty before Allah. The case of Prophet Moses killing a non-believer in defense of one of his Shia (followers) falls into this category. In fact Quran testifies the above mentioned fact by saying:

26:10

Behold your Lord called Moses: "Go to unto the wrongdoing folk:

26:11

The people of Pharaoh, will they not fear Allah?

26:12

He said: "O my Lord! I do fear that they will charge me with falsehood"

26:13

"My breast will be straitened and my speech may not go (smoothly), so send Aaron (to help me).

26:14

"And (further) they hold a charge of sin against me; and I fear they may slay me."

As we can see in the last verse, the sin of murder is what the people of Pharaoh considered to be sin and not Allah. They considered Moses guilty. As such, that was not a sin before Allah, but rather the charge of the government.

Prophet Moses did what he was supposed to do, that is helping the oppressed believer against the oppressor. Although he did not intend to kill the oppressor, it happened during that defense. It was a Satan's plan to make the situation more difficult for Moses (AS). By that unplanned murder, life was made harder for Moses (AS) since he had to stay away from Egypt, but this does not mean that he sinned. Sometimes defending the truth may cause

trouble but not sin. Despite all such troubles, Allah finally granted Moses (AS) victory over the unbelievers. Again, Prophet Moses (AS) was not a wrong-doer (Dhalim) otherwise it contradicts Verse 2:124 where Allah said that the position of God-assigned leadership shall not reach to the wrong-doers.

Another brother argued that Allah (SWT) has forbidden us from purifying ANYBODY in verse: "... hold NOT yourselves PURIFIED [53:32]" As such, even prophets and messengers can not be considered purified.

My response was that the verse is taken out of context, and thus has clouded the meaning. Let us carefully study the WHOLE verse:

Those who avoid great sins and shameful deeds, and only fell into small reprehensible faults, verily thy Lord is ample in forgiveness. He knows you well when He brings you out of the earth and when you are hidden in your mother's wombs therefore justify not yourselves. He knows best who (among you) guards against evil. (53:32)

This verse is saying: THOSE WHO HAVE COMMITTED SMALL REPREHENSIBLE FAULTS should not justify themselves. They should be careful not to fall victim to their egoism and pretend that they are the best when ONLY Allah (SWT) knows what is really in their hearts. As such, this verse does NOT apply to the Prophet(S.A.W.) who did not have any fault, or Allah (SWT) would have directed the verse at him(S.A.W.) as He (SWT) does when talking to or about him(S.A.W.). Therefore, the verse DOES NOT even come close to supporting an argument that the Prophet(S.A.W.) was a sinner.

Moreover Allah mentioned in Verse 33:33 of Quran that the Ahlul-Bayt of Prophet(S.A.W.) are PERFECTLY pure and flawless, then we can conclude that Allah is the one who is confirming that the Prophet is pure and thus it is in conformity with the above quoted verse which states only Allah knows who is the best and most purified. No need to mention that the Prophet(S.A.W.) is the first member of the Ahlul-Bayt, and if the Ahlul-Bayt are perfectly pure, so is the Prophet(S.A.W.).

A reader mentioned that: We identify with the Prophets and Messengers through their sin. That is, we look at the sin of the Prophets and the Messengers, and we identify our OWN sins with theirs!

The above assertion is off base. We do NOT identify with the Prophets through their SIN; we rather identify with them through their SUFFERING. There is a big difference between the two: Suffering necessitates patience in times of tribulation and adversity to survive through the ordeal one is undergoing. All the prophets and messengers (May Allah bless them) suffered greatly by virtue of their title as representatives of the of Supreme Being, Allah (SWT). We identify with that, and remain steadfast during our times of despair. As such, a prophet did NOT sin, but rather suffered. The Mercy from Allah (SWT) is NOT, as you state, that the prophets and messengers sin, but rather that they were sent to communicate and deliver the message of Allah (SWT) to us. And in so doing, they were not kings or high priests who would not be able to identify with the oppressed masses. Indeed, look at Moses (AS), the great Messenger from Allah (SWT), whose ENTIRE life was a miracle. The suffering that Moses (AS) endured evoked a sense of peace in the minds of his (AS) followers that served to strengthen them in times of great hardship under Pharaoh's oppression.

Similarly, the Messenger of Allah (SWT), Muhammad(S.A.W.), suffered when he was struck in his head, causing a severe injury to his jaw. He also suffered from hunger, rejection, a boycott from disbelievers, sarcasm, temptation, wars, mutiny, distrust from some of his followers, the hypocrites, betrayal, and then he, after his demise, also suffered by virtue of the massacring of his family. It is an authentic tradition that the Prophet(S.A.W.) during his lifetime said: "No Prophet has EVER suffered as I have suffered." The indication here was to how his own flesh and blood, his family-- which were dearer to him than his own soul, would be treated after his demise; not to mention the hardship he was exposed to during his lifetime. It is that kind of suffering that allows us to identify with the Prophets, NOT their sins!

Again, the argument clearly fails when we analyze it from the perspective of the "example or model" par excellence sent to humanity: If Allah (SWT) says: "You have indeed in the Messenger of Allah AN EXCELLENT EXEMPLAR for him who hopes in Allah and the Final Day, and who remember Allah much. (Quran 33:21)," (Emphasis Mine) He (SWT) means that our lives should be modeled around that "EXCELLENT EXEMPLAR." That's where the word "Sunnah --- the Prophet's(S.A.W.) custom or tradition" comes from. Now, if that model was corrupt (May Allah forgive us), then how can we model ourselves around it; we, then, will NEVER be able to cleanse ourselves!

Another brother stated To be human is to be a sinner; that is, sin is an innate part of us as human beings. I find highly disturbing the tendency among Muslims, Shia and Sunni likewise, to regard the Prophet Muhammad (saws) almost as a species of infallible demigod. I would like to first ask this brother if knows Muslims believe that angels are infallible, i.e., they do not make any mistakes. (Otherwise, some major flaws, among many, would be that the validity of Quran transmitted by Gabriel which will go seriously under question; and that the angels who record our deeds may write things incorrectly; and also the angel of death may take the life of a wrong person instead of another!!! 🌿 Allah stated in Quran: "...the angels do not violate the Commands of Allah, and do (precisely) what they are ordered. (66:6)"

If you also agree that angels are infallible, and if your above statement is true, then you consider angels are either god or demigod (? 🌿 (may Allah protect us). Therefore, your above statement is wrong. I just gave you an example of infallible species who are nothing but the creatures of God. They are neither God nor semi-god, nor demi-god, yet infallible.

Angels are programmed and work like faultless bug-free computers. They can not go against the orders of Allah. However, the prophets are NOT angels. They are all human, but purified human beings. That purification by Allah (SWT) as alluded to in the previously mentioned verses does NOT make them divine, but it does elevate them above the level of ordinary human beings in terms of denouncing sin.

The advantage of human over angel is that human is able to willingly obey God. In other words, the prophet has choice to either go right or wrong, but he chooses to go right always, and such, he is infallible while he has choice. A human can make mistakes, but he does not have to. If we make mistakes, it is not because we have to, but it is because of our foolishness, ignorance and lack of knowledge, or else because of the lack of control of our carnal desires. Those who say human has to make mistakes to be human, are generalizing their own weak soul to all others. They follow their lusts, and are envious to see if one never does that.

Based on Quran, the level of human CAN BE much higher than angels. (and of course, could go even lower than animals, on the other side) Quran states that all angels prostrated Prophet Adam (AS). This is enough to prove that the rank of the prophets is higher than that of angels. In fact, the best human beings (in terms of Taqwa) are the best of all the creatures, and the most honored before Allah. Remember also the story of Mi'raaj where there were places in the heavens that only Prophet Muhammad(S.A.W.) could get into, but the Angel Gabriel could not fly to. The Gabriel said to the Prophet that he (Gabriel) will burn if he wants to go further with the Prophet(S.A.W.).

One side remark, here, is that, Satan is not an angel. He was from Jinn (unseen creatures). Witness to that is Quran where it quotes the statement of Satan saying: "You have created me from fire." The unseen (Jinn) creatures are made of fire, and as such, they are not the angels. The Jinns, like human beings, have choice to go right or wrong, and will be accountable for their acts in the day of judgment.

A brother mentioned that there is a religious part of the prophet's life and a non-religious part. The danger of believing that every thing the prophet did was by order of God, causes that Muslims should imitate the prophet(S.A.W.) to the finest details otherwise they won't be obeying God!!! Even to what the prophet liked to drink and eat,...

My response to him was that ALL the acts of the Prophet were acts of worship. Even his eating, sleeping, etc., were worship, and as such, there was no non-religious part in his life! All he did were in full accordance with Allah's wishes and commandments. But religion is not limited to what is obligatory and what is forbidden. Most of the Prophet's actions fall in the category of what is "Mustahabb" (i.e., recommended) or what is "Mubaah" (i.e., OK either way).

Moreover, no one said we are required to imitate all the actions of the Prophet. If one eats what the Prophet preferred to eat, it will be all right and no one can blame him unless he claims that one should eat only what the Prophet ate. Obeying the Prophet(S.A.W.) means that if the Prophet ordered to do something or forbade to do something, then one is religiously REQUIRED to follow it, no matter if the order does not seem to be religious (which is a false imagination). In fact, ALL the orders and prohibitions of the Prophet were a part of religion. This is actually what the religion is about. Even his Ijtihad was in full accordance with the wish of Allah for Allah granted him the most perfect reason. Whatever came to the heart of Prophet(S.A.W.) is the order of God, and such it is a part of religion. Forget about that fabricated Hadith on agriculture.

As for eating food: Everything is Halaal, unless the Prophet prohibited it explicitly or implicitly. For instance, pork has been prohibited explicitly. Also any today's new product which was not at the time of the Prophet but has some ingredients which are extracts from those Haraam products, becomes Haraam implicitly.

Therefore, if the Prophet(S.A.W.) did not eat a special food, but he did not prohibit it either, we still can eat it, because we follow his general order that whatever has not been made Haraam, is Halaal. Also if he preferred a special food, but he did not mention that it is obligatory to eat it, it does not become obligatory to eat. Thus, the preference of the prophet for a special food is not considered to be the order of Prophet as you tried to imply. In religion, there are many things that are neither obligatory nor prohibited, and we have choice to do it or not. What the Prophet ate might be considered as recommended food, and not obligatory unless otherwise specified.

Regarding the verse: "Nor does he (Muhammad) speak out of his desire. It is no less than revelation that is revealed (Quran 53:3-4)," a brother said: The above verse is only limited to Quran. The pagan Arabs were calling the Prophet insane, and discrediting the Quranic revelations as the handiwork of the prophet. The meaning of the above verses is that the Quranic verses which the prophet is speaking about are not out of his desire, but are indeed Revelation. If everything the prophet said or did is revelation, then what is the difference between Quran and authentic Hadith?

My answer to this brother was that: Neither the above verses, nor the verses surrounding them specify limitation of any kind. There is no mention of "Quran" in the above verses nor the verses before and after, and therefore, your claim is unsupported, at least from the Quran. The Verse 53:3 exactly talks about "the speech" of the Prophet and not necessarily Quran, and thus, the rule mentioned in the next verse covers ALL his speeches. The pagan Arabs did not criticize the Prophet for the Quran alone. They also criticized him for his claim of prophethood as well as his teachings and ideas.

As for the difference between Quran and Hadith: Both Quran and genuine Hadith are from Allah. The Prophet did not say anything of his own desire. However, there is a difference

between Quran and Hadith:

- Quran is well-proven, but is NOT well-understood (see note below)
- Hadith is NOT well-proven, but is well-understood.

What I meant by "Quran is well-proven", is that we have no doubt about its authenticity, genuineness, and that has not been fabricated.

What I meant by "Quran is NOT well-understood", is that most of its verses are ambiguous and only "Those who are Firmly Grounded in Knowledge" (i.e., the Prophet and his Ahlul-Bayt) have touched the depth of its meaning. Also Quran only specifies the general rules. For all these and many other reasons, Quran can not be considered as the sources of Guidance ALONE. It needs an interpreter, and this is where the Hadith plays its role. By genuine Hadith we can get close to the understanding of Quran. Allah said in Quran:

He it is Who has sent down to thee the Book, in it are some clear verses; they are the Essence of the Book; and others which are ambiguous. But those in whose hearts is perversity follow the part there of that is ambiguous seeking discord and searching for its hidden meanings but no one knows its hidden meanings except Allah and those who are firmly grounded in knowledge (Quran 3:7)

What I meant by "Hadith is NOT well-proven", is that, since we have not personally met the Prophet (or his successors), we are not sure if such and such Hadith are genuine. The important point which has the answer to your question is: If we were at the time of the Prophet and would have heard the Hadith from the mouth of the Prophet(S.A.W.), then that Hadith would have been AS BINDING AS Quran for us, and we can not prefer Quran over that Hadith, rather I would say, that Hadith which was heard in person is preferred to our defective understanding of Quran because most verses of Quran are ambiguous, but the Hadith we heard from the Prophet is clear. Also, there are many cases where the Hadith explains the exceptions of the general Quranic rules, and as such, it may SEEM to be contradictory with the Quran.

However, since we have not personally heard the Hadith from the Prophet (or his true successors), we need to examine its documentation (i.e., the chain of narrators who passed the Hadith) and the number of similar narrations in that regard to determine the overall strength of what has been attributed to the Prophet(S.A.W.). Some of the requirements of the authenticity of Hadith are as follows:

- It should not be in clear contradiction with well-established concepts in Quran;
- It should not be in clear contradiction with other well-established traditions;
- All the transmitters of the Hadith in the chain of transmitters should be righteous and just, etc.

Most Sunnis, however, do not consider the justice of the narrators as a criterion. They narrate from whoever saw the Prophet(S.A.W.) and claimed to be Muslim.

The bother, then, asked: If the speech of prophet are the literal word of God, then why are they not included in the Quran itself?

Not all the traditions are literal words of God. Only some traditions are the literal words of God such as Hadith al-Qudsi. They are not a part of Quran though. Some other traditions are the commands of Allah transmitted by Gabriel, and thus, they are indirect words of Allah. They include the divine commentaries of the verses of Quran which were revealed along with Quran, but not as a part of Quran. The rest of genuine traditions are the information and commandments that Allah induced into the heart of the Prophet directly, and as such, they are the indirect words of God. This includes his Ijtihad and whatever passed through his mind.

Therefore, the some traditions are direct literal word of God, and some are indirect words of God, and as such, all of them are either revelation or inspiration, and are all from Allah. The Prophet did not say ANYTHING of his own. The reason that they are not a part of Quran, is because they were not supposed to be! A better answer is: Quran is an encapsulated database which provides general information for all ages. The Hadith is more specific and furnishes more details and also provides commentary to the Quranic injunctions without which Quran can not be understood correctly.

Conclusion

In conclusion, I repeat the question: If Allah (SWT) had inspired "sinful" Prophets and Messengers to lead people to the Right Path, it would mean that Allah (SWT) approves of sinfulness! Why then does He (SWT) prohibit it (sin, that is)?

Allah and His Angels, send blessings on the Prophet: O you who believe! Send your blessings on him, and salute him with all respect. (Quran: 33:56)

Wassalam.

End of Part 3 of 3