



سلام دوستان عزیز؛

دیدم متن‌ها بسیار به هم ریخته است لذا بر آن شدم که دستی بر سر رویش بکشم و از خانم حامدی درخواست تصاویر متن‌ها رو نمودم که جا دارد از ایشان تشکر کنم، این متن‌ها توسط نرم افزار تبدیل به تکس (فونت شده اند) که احتمال غلط املائی هم دارند تا آنجا که توانستم اصلاح نمودم شاید کلماتی باشند که اصلاح نشده باشند، (۱۶۸ تا ۱۷۳) ترجمه متن دوستان را بصورت جمله به جمله در آن قرار دادم و شماره صفحه‌ها را هم در بالای آنان مشخص است. شاید به مقدار از جمله‌ها در صفحه بعد رفته باشد که آن هم به خاطر کامل شدن جمله به جهت همخوانی با ترجمه آن است.

صفحه‌های که سبز هستند برای امتحان است و صفحه‌های که قرمز در امتحان نمی‌آیند. ترجمه کلاس روز پنجشنبه از صفحه ۱۶۸ تا ۱۷۳ رو کامل کردم ولی هنوز ترجمه کلاس دوستان روز چهارشنبه کامل نیست دارم کامل می‌کنم ولی مشکل اینه که همه رو ندارم.

طبق گفته استاد دکتر محمودزاده سئولات از صفحه ۱۶۸ تا ۱۷۳ و از ۱۸۲ تا ۱۹۲ می‌باشد (منظورشان صفحه ۱۹۱ که آخرین صفحه است) می‌باشد.

فاصله خطوط را هم زیاد گرفتم که آگه خواستید ترجمه کلمه به کلمه را روی آن بنویسید بتوانید انجامش دهید. پیشنهاد من این است که اینکار را انجام دهید شاید این موضوع کمک‌تان کند. ش کار هنوز ادامه دارد منتظر ارسال‌های بعدی باشید...

با تقدیم احترام - محمد حسین بیات



168 Satarupa Dasgupta

engaged with 'audiences' at their most active, producing as well as receiving media content" (Downing 2001, 835).

One of the characteristics of the Sonagaehi Project was that the target population - the sex workers - were not considered to be passive recipients of information lacking in choice or agency, but instead they were treated as change agents themselves. (Blankenship, Friedman, Dworkin, and Mantell 2006; Jana, Banerjee, Saha and Dutta 1999).

یکی از مشخصات طرح سوناگچی این بود که جمعیت هدف - کارگران جنسی - به عنوان دریافت کنندگان منفعل اطلاعات که فاقد قدرت انتخاب یا

عاملیت در نظر گرفته نشدند، بلکه خود به عنوان تغییر محسوب می گردند (بلنکن شیب، فریدمن، دورکین و منتل ۲۰۰۶؛ جانا، بنرجی، ساها و دوتا ۱۹۹۹)

AE noted previously, the peer education program generated by the Sonagachi Project succeeded in achieving outcomes beyond its immediate objectives of controlling transmission of HIV/AIDS and STDS.

همانگونه که قبلاً خاطر نشان شد، برنامه آموزش همسالان که توسط طرح سوناگچی تهیه شده موفق به دستیابی به نتایجی فراتر از اهداف اولیه خود که

کنترل و شیوع ویروس ایدز و اچ ای وی و بیماری های رقابتی بود، شده است .

The community outreach programs brought sex workers together and facilitated a sense of camaraderie among them.

برنامه های کمک و امدادی این انجمن منجر به گردآوری روسپیان دورهم و ایجاد حس رفاقتی در بین آنها شد.

Training of the sex workers by the program management as outreach workers, and subsequent dialogue among the sex workers themselves, helped to decrease the perceived powerlessness of a heavily marginalized community (Bandopadhyay Ray, Banerjee et al 2002).

آموزش روسپیان از طریق مدیریت برنامه به عنوان کارگران امداد رسان و گفت گوهای بعدی در میان خود روسپیان کاهش حس ناتوانی این اجتماع به شدت

محروم ، کمک کرد. (باندپادای ری، بانرجی و دیگران ۲۰۰۲)

Perhaps such action undertaken by the sex workers themselves can be said to be in concurrence with Friere's observation that "the oppressed must intervene critically in the situation which surrounds them and whose mark they bear ... while conviction of the necessity of the struggle is indispensable to the leadership, it is also necessary for the oppressed" (Freire 1970, 54).



شاید بتوان گفت این عمل روسپیان در تطابق با این مشاهده ی فریر است که " ستم دیده می بایست منتقدانه در وضعیتی که آنها را احاطه کرده مداخله

نمایند در حالیکه اعتقاد به ضرورت مبارزه بر رهبران واجب به نظر می سد این امر بر ستم دیده نیز لازم است" (فریر ۱۹۷۰، ۵۴)

Importantly, Freire did not emphasize mass media for achieving effective communication but focused on interpersonal interaction.

اساسا فریر بر رسانه جمعی برای دست یابی به ارتباطات مؤثر تأکید نکرد بلکه بر کنش متقابل بین فردی تمرکز کرد.

The Sonagachi Project also did not utilize the mass media tools but rather focused on "face-to face interactivity" that Freire considered at the center of a communication process (Downing 2001, 834).

طرح سوناگچی نیز از ابزارهای رسانه جمعی بهره نگرفت بلکه بیشتر بر تمایلات چهره به چهره فریر آن را در کانون فرایند ارتباط قلمداد کرد، تمرکز

کرد. (دونینگ ۲۰۰۱، ۸۳۴)

The dialogue initiated by the sex workers with their peers effectively helped in disseminating awareness information about sexually transmitted diseases and safe sex behavior.

گفتگوی که توسط مددکاران جنسی با همتایانشان (روسپیان دیگر) انجام شد به طور مؤثری اطلاعات هشدار دهند در مورد بیماریهای

مقاربتی و رفتارایمن جنسی کمک نمود

Also it increased social participation by resulting in the formation of a sex workers' self-governed organization that looked after the needs and rights of its members.

همچنین این امر باعث افزایش مشارکت اجتماعی و شکل گیری سازمان خودمختار روسپیان شده است که در پی نیازها و حقوق اعضای خود می باشد .

Perhaps the guiding principles of the Sonagaehi Project can find a resonance in Freire's idea of a humanizing pedagogy "in which the leadership establishes a permanent relationship of dialogue with the oppressed ... the method ceases to be an Instrument by which the teachers can manipulate the students, because it expresses the consciousness of the students themselves" (Freire 1970, 55-6).

شاید اصول تعلیماتی طرح سوناگچی بتواند یک همنوایی و رزونانس در عقیده فریر درباره پرورش انسانی بیابد که در آن مدیریت رابطه گفتمانی دائمی با

مظلومین و افراد ستمدیده دارد.

و یا



شاید اصول هدایت در طرح سوناگچی بتواند یک همنوایی در ایده فریر در باره آموزش انسانی پیدا کند: "که در آن مدیریت روابط دائمی در گفتگو با آسیب دیدگان را پایه گذاری می کند... روش متوقف می شود به اینکه ابزاری باشد تا معلم ها بتوانند دانش آموزان را دستکاری کنند! چون آن آگاهی خود دانش آموزان را بیان می کند." (فریر، ۱۹۷۰، ۶)

169 Sonagachi Project

Such a case as: the Sonagachi Project in which the mantle of leadership is assumed by the oppressed themselves can propose a unique casestudy especially when analyzed in the context of Freirean ideology of emancipation and empowerment.

در چنین مواردی مانند طرح سوناگچی که در آن سمت رهبری وظیفه خود افراد محرم گرفته می شود می تواند یک مطالعه موردی بی نظیری فرض شود (در نظر گرفته شود) بویژه هنگامی که در متن ایدولوژی رهایی بخش و توانمندساز فریر تحلیل شود.

The Sonagachi Project as an Example of Empowerment Communication

طرح سوناگچی به عنوان نمونه ای ارتباطات توانمندساز

Empowerment communication has its theoretical framework based in participatory and development communication but is specifically geared towards fostering research agendas that facilitate social transformation and justice.

ارتباطات توانمندساز مبتنی بر چارچوب نظری (رویکرد نظری) ارتباطات توسعه ای مشارکتی است، اما به طور خاص در جهت ترویج عوامل تحقیقی است که گذار اجتماعی و عدالت را تسهیل می کنند.

As Mefalopoulos (2002) observes, communication for development is motivated towards generating participation, dialogue, and dissemination of vital knowledge - "Communication can assist development by advocating and adopting models that genuinely require dialogue as a form of collaboration among all stakeholders and that genuinely require sharing knowledge as the best form of mutual education" (Mefalopoulos 2002, 836)

همانگونه که میفالوپولوس مطرح می کند ارتباطات مربوطه به توسعه به سمت ایجاد (تولید) مشارکت، گفتگو و بخش آگاهی های مهم حرکت می کند "ارتباطات می تواند از طریق توسعه و انطباق الگوهای که اساساً نیازمند گفتگو به عنوان شکلی از توافق میان همه طرفها هستند و این امر خود نیازمند



.. Yet empowerment of the target population often remains a desired but not achieved result.

با این حال هنوز توانمندسازی جمعیت هدف اغلب در حد یک مطلوب (ایده آل) باقی است اما خواسته دست نیافتنی نیست.

Empowerment communication, with its emphasis on power differentials, potentially offers analytical means of addressing structural inequalities in groups that historically have been marginalized.

ارتباطات توانمندسازی با تأکیدش بر اختلافات (نابرابری) قدرت، فی نفسه ابزارهای تحلیلی معطوف به نابرابریهای ساختاری در رابطه گروه های که بطور

تاریخی محروم بوده اند را مطرح می کند. (پیشنهاد می کند)

As White (2004) observes, empowerment needs to be based within the universal principles of social justice:

"one framework of public responsibility that has broad cultural and political acceptance is the language of human and collective rights" (White 2004, 830).

همانگونه که وایت (۲۰۰۴) مطرح می کند توانمندسازی نیازمند تأکید بر اصول جهانی عدالت اجتماعی است (به این معنی که یک چارچوب مسئولیت

پذیری عمومی که پذیرش سیاسی و فرهنگی گسترده ای دارد زبان مشترکی است که بر گرفته از حقوق جمعی و بشری باشد) وایت، ۲۰۰۴، ۸۳۰)

Perhaps the following observation of Mefalopulos offers a description of empowerment communication in the most succinct way:

احتمالاً تحقیق زیر که مربوط به میفالوپلوس است توصیفی از ارتباطات توانمندسازی را به کوتاه ترین راه (شیوه) بیان می کند که عبارتند از:

Empowerment communication intends to be a step further towards its development that gives control over their own lives to the very people who have traditionally been made passive, or partially active, recipients of those efforts by those in charge of development policies.

ارتباطات توانمندسازی معمولاً به درجه ای بالاتر از توسعه فعلی اش می رسد زیرا (که) بسیاری از مردم در نتیجه آن قدرت کنترل زندگی شان را پیدا می

کنند کسانی که بطور سنتی منفعل، یا کم تحرک بوده اند و نتیجه تلاش هایشان در پشتیبانی از سیاست های توسعه دریافت می کنند.

While still within the boundaries of the current paradigm, empowerment communication also advocates its demolition, basing it on the genuine application of democratic ideals, which should QY now pay more attention to the universal human rights regardless of other factors, e.g, nationality, religion and socio-economic status. (Mefalopulos 2002, 836)

در حالیکه هنوز در محدوده پارادایم جاری، ارتباطات توانمندسازی نیز از تخریب آن حمایت می کنند، و اساس آن را بر پایه کاربرد واقعی آرمانهای



دموکراتیک قرار می دهد که باید اکنون با توجه بیشتر به حقوق بشر جهانی صرف نظر از عوامل دیگری مانند مکتب، مذهب و پایگاه اقتصادی، اجتماعی

محقق گردد. (میفالوپولس ۲۰۰۲، ۸۳۲)

170 Satarupa Dasgupta

Sex workers in India are vulnerable to HN /AIDS infection due to reasons not restricted to unprotected sex alone.

کارگران جنسی در هندوستان در مقابل شیوع ایدز در امان نیستند به این دلیل که به تنها به رابطه جنسی حمایت نشده محدود نیستند.

Their marginalized position in the social hierarchy results from a combination of factors like gender, class and social stigmatization, and ostracization.

موقعیت محروم آنان در سلسه مراتب نظام اجتماعی از ترکیب عواملی مانند جنسیت، بدنام سازی اجتماعی و گروهی و تردشده گی حاصل می شود.

Their social exclusion compounds their marginalized status and enhances material deprivation.

محرومیت اجتماعی آنها وضعیت محروم آنها را وخیم تر می کند و به محرومیت جنسی آنها می افزاید.

More than often they are rendered powerless to take decisions about their own health and welfare, and hence often do not respond favorably to behavior change intervention techniques (Jana, Basu, Rotheram-Borns, and Newman 2004).

غریب به اتفاق آنها از تصمیم گیری درباره سلامت و رفاه شان ناتوان هستند از این رو اغلب به طور مطلوبی به تکنیک های مداخله برای تغییر رفتار پاسخ

نمی دهند. (جانا، باسو، رسوم بروسو و نیومن ۲۰۰۴)

Consequently, conventional communication, which is aimed towards generating behavior change, may prove to be inadequate towards achieving the desired goal of adoption and implementation of safer sexual practices among the sex workers.

در نتیجه ارتباطات قراردادی یا کلامی که به قصد ایجاد تغییر در رفتار برقرار شد ممکن است برای دستیابی به هدف مورد نظر در رابطه با اقباس و به

کارگیری رفتارهای جنسی سالم در بین خدمتکاران جنسی نامناسب باشد.

"Given these conditions sex workers as a group will have to be enabled to break through the structural barriers that keep them excluded from access to resources as well as participation in society" (Jana, Banerjee, Saha and Dutta 1999, 6).

این شرایط محدود کننده خدمتکاران جنسی به عنوان یک گروه آنها را مجبور خواهد کرد که منابع ساختاری بشکنند که آن ها را از دسترسی به منابع برای



Perhaps the implementation of empowerment communication in such a situation might be prudent.

احتمالا استفاده از ارتباطات توانمندساز در یک چنین شرایطی مس تواند محتاطانه صورت بگیرد.

As Mefalopulos appropriately notes on empowerment communication, "even when paved by the best intention, communication cannot be the road to people's empowerment, unless a new paradigm will provide a plausible option for refusing or negating an external imposition to any given community or group of people" (Mefalopulos 2002, 836).

همانگونه که میفالوپولوس به درستی درباره ارتباطات توانمندساز می گوید تازمانی که ارتباطات با بهترین نیت اجرا نشود ارتباطات نمی تواند راهی برای توانمندسازی مردم باشد تازمانی که یک انگاره جدیدی یک گزینه موجه برای نفی وضوح بیرونی برای هر جامعه یا گروهی از مردم فراهم خواهد کرد.

While it can be postulated that the application of empowerment communication may be appropriate among sex workers in India, can the Sonagachi Project fall in the ranks of the said variety of communication? Evidently, the Sonagachi Project incorporated activities that were not included in the agenda of the initiative originally.

آیا می توان فرض کرد یا پذیرفت که کاربرد ارتباطات توانمندساز ممکن است در بین خدمتکاران جنسی در هندوستان مناسب باشد در حالیکه طرح سوناگچی از نظر رتبه ارتباطات متنوعی که بیان شده است افت کند.

اساسا فعالیت های گنجانده شده در طرح سوناگچی در دستور کار پیشنهادی وجود نداشت.

The project succeeded in achieving its targeted outcomes - significant increase in condom usage and significant decrease in HTV /AIDS infection incidence.

این طرح در دست یابی به هدف تعریف شده اش قابل استفاده از کاندوم و کاهش قابل توجه پیشگیری از شیوع بیماری ایدز موفق شد.

But in addition the project. also generated literacy programs directed towards the sex workers and their kin, loan services, micro-credit initiatives and provident funds for the sex workers, and finally caused the trade unionization of the sex workers.

اما علاوه بر این طرح برنامه های سوادآموزی برای کار گزاران جنسی و خویشاوندان آنها، خدمات وام، طرح های اعتباری خرد و دراندیشانه برای کارگران جنسی در نظر گرفته شد و در نهایت این امر باعث تشکیل اتحادیه کار گزاران جنسی گردید.

The Sonagachi Project undertook efforts to prevent harassment of sex workers by the police, local anti-social elements, and pimps.



طرح سوناگچی برای جدایی از آزار کارگران جنسی توسط پلیس، عواملی ضد اجتماع و انسان های شرور تلاشهای را انجام داد.

171 Sonagachi Project

The project also managed to Incorporate the sex workers' children in mainstream schools.

همچنین این طرح موفق شد تا کودکان کارگران جنسی را در مدارس عادی وارد کند.

Out-of-school education and vocational training were also imparted to these children,

همینطور کلاس های فوق برنامه و آموزش در اوقات فراغت نیز برای این کودکان در نظر گرفته شد.

Hence, the Sonagachi Project endeavored to mitigate the stigmatization of the targeted women both within and outside the realm of sex work.

پس طرح سوناگچی تلاش کرد تا بدنامی زنان هدفدار در داخل یا خارج از حوزه کار جنسی را کاهش دهد.

In order to effectuate the peer outreach program, the sex workers were also given "on-the-job training and special capacity-building sessions" (Jana, Banerjee, Saha, and Dutta 11.9919, 4).

به منظور تأثیر گذاری بر برنامه های توسعه ای خدمتکاران جنسی نیز به کارآموزش و ایجاد فرصتهای توانمندساز به شغل آموزش پرداختند. (جانا، بنرجی،

سها و دوتا ۱۱.۱۹۹۹،۴)

Jana, Banerjee, Saha, and Dutta (1999) note such interactive training sessions increased the sex workers' self-confidence and paved the path for future initiatives such as forming their own micro-credit society.

جانا، بنرجی، سها و دوتا (۱۹۹۹) خاطر نشان می کنند که اینگونه آموزشها تعاملی اعتماد نفس به خدمتکاران جنسی را افزایش دهد و مسیر تحقیق طرح

های آینده همانند تشکیل جامعه کوچک متعلق به آنان را هموار کرد.

The sessions also inspired the sex workers to combine and form an exclusive platform for themselves.

این دوره ها، خدمتکاران جنسی را برای ادغام و تشکیل یک پلات فرم ادغامی برای خودشان ترغیب می دهد.

Referred to as the Durbar Mohila Sam.nwaya Committee (OMSC) the sex workers' collective evolved out of the Sonagachi Project and offered them aJI opportunity to assert their collective voices.

با استناد به گزارش کمیته سام موهیلا دوربار، اجتماع کارگران جنسی به خارج از طرح سوناگچی نیز گسترش یافت و به آنان فرصتی برای ارزیابی صدای

اجتماعشان (مطالبات اجتماعشان) ارایه کرد.

"The DMSC furthered in-group recognition among sex workers, and the articulation and demand for their rights as workers" (Jana, Basu, Rotheram-Borus, and Newman 2004, 411).



دی ام اس سی شناخت درون گروهی بین کارگران جنسی انجمن و تقاضا و مطالبات آنان برای حقوقشان به عنوان خدمتکاران جنسی را افزایش داد.

Importantly DMSC now participates actively In AIDS and sex-workers' conferences across the world and involves itself in issues pertaining to sex workers internationally (Hogg, Cahn, Katabjra et al 2002; Nath 2000).

کمیته دی ام اس سی در حال حاضر و به طور قابل توجهی در همایش های مربوط به بیماری ایدز و خدمتکاران جنسی در سراسر جهان به طور فعال شرکت می کند و خودش را ملزم به حل مسائل مربوط به خدمتکاران جنسی در سطح بین المللی می داند.

Evidently the Sonagaehi Project obtained outcomes that were not anticipated by the project initially.

بطور قطع طرح سوناگچی نتایجی را بدست آورده که آغاز اجرای این طرح پیش بینی نشده اند.

As Jana, Basu, Rotheram-Borus, and Newman (2004, 411) note: "even as the Sonagachi Project began with a vision of occupational health, it was not foreseen that over the course of a decade the sex workers would become a quasitrade union."

همانگونه که جانا، باسو، روسرام بورس و نیومن (۲۰۰۴، ۴۱۱) خاطر نشان می کند پیش از اینکه طرح سوناگچی با دیدگاه سلامت شغلی شروع کند پیش

بینی نمی شد که آنها کمتر از یک دهه بتوانند تبدیل به یک اتحادیه شبه تجاری شود.

Additionally the Sonagachi Project facilitated vocational training and financial programs for the sex workers and their kin.

علاوه بر این طرح سوناگچی آموزش اوقات فراغت و برنامه های مالی برای خدمتکاران جنسی و خویشان آنان را میسر کرد.

It is evident that initiatives like the Sonagachi Project can ultimately transcend their primary agenda and facilitate greater outcomes.

آشکار است که طرح های مانند طرح سوناگچی می توانند در نهایت از خواسته های اولیه شان فراتر روند و نتایج بزرگتری رقم بزنند.

Perhaps it will be right to refer to such a mode of participatory communication and Intervention as evidenced by the Sonagachi Project as empowerment communication.

احتمالا استناد به یک چنین الگوی از مداخله و ارتباطات مشارکتی چنانکه در طرح سوناگچی به عنوان ارتباطات توانمندساز محقق شد، کاردرستی

خواهد بود.

As Mefalopulos (2002, 836) notes: "participatory communication, and even more, empowerment communication, is not just about decision making in the development context, but it affects every aspect of the social, economic and political sphere of life."



همانگونه که میفالوپولوس (۲۰۰۲، ۸۳۶) خاطر نشان می کند: "ارتباطات مشارکتی و حتی بیشتر از آن ارتباطات توانمندساز تنها مربوط به تصمیم گیری در بازه بهتر توسعه نیست بلکه بر هر جنبه از حوزه اجتماعی، اقتصادی و سیاسی زندگی تأثیر می گذارد."

172 Satarupa Dasgupta

Thus the Sonagachi Project besides facilitating safe sex practices managed to provide social, economic, and political agency to the sex workers.

بنابراین طرح سوناگچی در کنار مدیریت تسهیل رفتارهای جنسی سالم اهدافی اجتماعی، اقتصادی و سیاسی برای خدمتکاران جنسی را فراهم کرد.

By rearticulating prostitution the project endeavored to de-stigmatize sex work and mitigate social powerlessness of the sex workers.

با معضل بندی روسپی گری این طرح تلاش کرد تا از خدمت جنسی ننگ زدایی و محرومان اجتماعی از خدمت کاران جنسی را تشکیل دهند.

By forming credit unions the project aimed to provide financial self-sufficiency to the sex workers.

با تأسیس اتحادیه اعتباری این طرح قصد داشت تا خودکفایی مالی برای خدمتکاران جنسی را فراهم نمایند.

And by offering the opportunity of forming a union the project facilitated political visibility of the sex workers.

و با فراهم کردن فرصت تشکیل اتحادیه ظهور سیاسی خدمتکاران جنسی را نیز تسهیل نمیشد.

Notwithstanding its initial objective of being a health behavior change endeavor, the project started to operate within the framework of public responsibility and the universalist discourse of human rights, which White (2004) terms as the essential element of empowerment communication.

علیرقم هدف اولیه این طرح که تلاش برای ایجاد رفتار سالم بود، این طرح در شروع به اقدام در چارچوب مسئولیت عمومی و گفتمان جهانی حقوق بشر

نمود که وایت (۲۰۰۴) از آن به عنوان عنصر اساسی ارتباطات توانمندساز یاد می کند.

Conclusion

نتایج

"Success in the long term occurs when the developmental nature of prevention programs is recognized" (Jana, Basu, Botheram-Borus, and Newman 2004, 413).

موفقیت در بلند مدت هنگامی اتفاق می افتد که، ماهیت توسعه ای برنامه های پیشگیرانه به رسمیت شناخته شود (جانا، باسو، ویوسرام بروسو

نیومن ۲۰۰۴، ۴۱۳)

The Sonagachi Project appears to incorporate the guiding principles of the participation communication



paradigm and may serve as a relevant case-study for planning sustainable interventions among disempowered or marginalized groups across the world.

در طرح سوناگاچی اصول راهنمای متناظر انگاره ارتباطات و ممکن است به عنوان یک مطالعه موردی برای برنامه ریزی مداخلات پایدار در بین گروه های ناتوان یا حاشیه ای (منزوی) در سراسر جهان مورد استفاده قرار گیرد.

While the project does not conform to theoretical frameworks of development such as modernization, it appears to encapsulate the Freirean philosophy of emancipation and empowerment.

در حالیکه این طرح با چارچوبهای نظری توسعه همانند نسازی سازگار نیست به نظر می رسد فلسفه رهای بخش و توانمندساز فرین را نیز رد می کند.

The Sonagachi Project also appears to incorporate characteristics of empowerment communication,

همچنین در طرح سوناگاچی ویژگیهای متناظر ارتباطات توانمندساز ظاهر می شوند.

Perhaps it will be relevant to note here that a future study can explore further such participatory communication frameworks in the light of the Habermasian theory of communicative action.

شاید بی ارتباط نباشد که در اینجا خاطر نشان کنیم که مطالعات آینده می توانند از چارچوبهای ارتباطات مشارکتی به طور آشکار از نظریه کنش ارتباطی هابرماس بهره بیشتری ببرند.

The creation of a space by the project for dialogue and collective action can be analyzed in the context of Habermas' conceptualization of "public sphere."

ایجاد یک فضا در این طرح برای گفتگو و کنش جمعی می تواند در متن مفهوم پردازای هابرماس درباره ((حوزه عمومی)) تحلیل شود.

One of the drawbacks of the Sonagachi Project is the lack of data verifying the effectiveness of the project.

یکی از موانع طرح سوناگاچی فقدان اطلاعات موثق برای استفاده در این طرح است.

The researchers cite statistics from UNAIDS and NACO which show a significant drop in the incidence of HIV infection and a significant increase in condom usage in Sonagachi after the project was implemented.

محققان آمارهای را از یونیدو و ناکو نقل می کنند که نشان می دهد که یک افت (کاهش شدیدی) معناداری در شیوع ایدز و افزایش معناداری در استفاده از کاندوم در سوناگاچی بعد از این که این طرح اجرا شد، اتفاق افتاده است.

But the researchers themselves admit that no studies were undertaken that specifically measured the efficacy of the Sonagachi Project.

اما خود محققان اقرار می کنند که هیچ مطالعه ای که بطور خاص اثر گذاری یا کارآمدی طرح سوناگاچی را سنجیده باشد، صورت نگرفته است.



173 Sonagachi Project

As the authors emphasize, "a randomized controlled trial has yet to demonstrate the efficacy of the intervention model" (Jana, Basu, Rotheram-Borus, and Newman 2004, 406).

اگرچه محققان تأکید می کنند که هنوز "یک آزمایش نمونه ای کنترل کننده برای تشخیص میزان اثر گذاری الگوی مداخله گرانه" انجام نده است (جانا،

راسو، رسوم بروسو نیومن ۲۰۰۴، ۴۰۶)

It is however not certain whether the effectiveness of the Sonagachi model was tested or not.

هر چند مشخص نیست که آیا اثر بخشی الگوی طرح سوناگچی آزمون شده است یا خیر.

For Basu, Jana, Rotheram-Borus et al. (2004) note that the Sonagachi Project was replicated among a group of sex workers in North-Eastern India.

زیرا باسو، جاننا، رسوم بروسو و دیگران (۲۰۰۴) خاطر نشان می کنند که طرح سوناگچی در بین یک گروه از خدمتکاران جنسی در شمال شرقی هندوستان،

جواب داده است.

The Latter study results show the efficacy of a community-based intervention process in tneareasmg safe sex practices and decreasing HIV/AIDS incidence.

نتایج مطالعات بعدی کارایی یک فرآیند مداخله گر اجتماع محور در افزایش رفتارهای جنسی سالم و کاهش شیوع ایدز نشان می دهند.

However the said study does not mention whether the intervention in North-Eastern India managed to replicate the multiple outcomes of the Sonagaehi Project that included empowerment of the sex workers within social, political, and economic realms.

با این حال مطالعه ای که ذکر شده نمی گوید که آیا مداخله در شمال شرقی هندوستان با آزمون نتایج چندگانه طرح سوناگچی مدیریت شده اند یا خیر

چنانچه نتایج چندگانه طرح سوناگچی شامل توانمندسازی خدمتکاران جنسی در حوزه های اجتماعی، سیاسی و اقتصادی است.

Bandopadhyay, Ray, Banerjee, et al. (2002) also conducted in-depth focus group interviews that demonstrated the efficacy of the participation-based community development approach adopted by the Sonagachi Project.

باندوپاداما، رای، بنرجی و دیگران (۲۰۰۲) نیز مصاحبه های گروهی عمقی را انجام دادند که بر اساس آن کارآمدی رویکرد توسعه مشارکت محور اجتماعی

را که از طرح سوناگچی اقتباس کرده بودند را تشخیص دادند.

Notwithstanding the lack of concrete data ascertaining the effectiveness of the Sonagachi Project, one may observe that the unique methodology adopted by the initiative and its multiple outcomes emphasize the



importance of a sustainable participation-based community intervention program.

يك شخص ممكن است على رقم فقدان ارزىابى مبتنى بر اثر بخشى اطلاعات عىنى در مورد طرح سوناگاچى مطرح كند كه روش تحقىقى بى نظرى در اين طرح به كار گرفته شده است، و نتاىج پندگانه آن بر اهمىت برنامه مداخله اى مشاركت محور اجتماعى تأكىد مى كند.

On a concluding note, the Sonagachi Project may be termed as an example of "sophisticated epistemology" in the field of development communication that, as Huesea (2003, 566) emphasizes, creates "an understanding of social reality in between people, in material contexts and in communication."

درىك جمع بندى نهاىى و همانگونه كه هوسكا (۲۰۰۳، ۵۶۶) تأكىد مى كند . طرح سوناگاچى به عنوان نمونه اى است (معرفت شناسى جامع) در حوزه ارتباطات توسعه تلقى شود، كه دركى از واقعىت اجتماعى در مردم در زمىنه هاى عىنى و در ارتباطات، اىجاد مى كند.

In sum, the Sonagachi Project may be a development communication model. for both further academic research as well as aid agencies funding similar projects.

بطور خلاصه طرح سوناگاچى ممكن است الگوىى از ارتباطات توسعه اى برائى تحقىقات دانشگاهى بشر و هىمنطور طرح هاى مشابه مالى مؤسسات (كمك رسان) حماىتى، باشد.



Roma Project: A Case Study Set in Europe

Eva Szalvai

Introduction

During the past few decades the conceptual framework for international development has changed. In particular, the understanding of development communication has undergone a major paradigm shift as outlined in the earlier chapters. The earlier view, based on hard economic indicators such as GDP growth and a Western-type of modernization approach, had been long criticized. Relying on Marxist ideology (Frank 1969; Portas 1974) and the basic need approach (Grant 1978; Streeten 1979), critical development communication scholars started to look into socio-economic change not only from a materialistic but also from a structural standpoint of view (Huesca 2003b). Incorporation of some postmodern theories to critical view, such as feminism, environmentalism, and subaltern research influenced a major shift in the long-held views about development in the southern hemisphere (Mody 2003). Thus the embracing, rather than rejecting of local culture, religion, and ethics, together with the accentuation of traditional communication methods resulted in a significant change in the theories and practices of development communication (Melkote and Steeves 2001).

George Soros, the social commentator and philanthropist, is the founder of the Open Society Institute (OSI), an international network of NGOs dedicated to initiating and supporting civic society activities (Open Society Institute 2006). Soros's philosophy and the roots of his praxis are based on the theory of the Open Society, a notion first developed by Karl Popper in the middle of the twentieth century (Popper 1945). This chapter examines the forms and practices of development communication in the OSI's longitudinal

176 Eva Szalvai

project with Roma people in Central and Eastern Europe (OSI Initiatives 2006). The case study identifies the corresponding development paradigms present in the OSI's practices and communication techniques. It provides examples of the manner in which the OSI deals with cultural and economic issues of Roma people, as well as identifying forms of communication the project uses to reach Roma ethnic communities in Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Romania, and Russia.

After referring to the three paradigms in development communication, this chapter details the core principles of the OSI. Referring to their historical roots, there is a summary of the Roma situation in Central-Eastern



Europe and the reasons behind the OSI's Roma initiative. Analyzing the different development communication discourses in the Roma Initiative's online presentation, the OSI's path for social change and the type of development communication used in the different practices throughout the 15 years of its project are detailed. Finally, the chapter concludes with a report on the results of the Roma Initiative and about its successor, the "Decade of Roma Inclusion" sponsored by several international organizations and supported by the OSI and the World Bank.

Through this case study it is argued that although all three development communication paradigm (modernization, critical, and empowerment) may be present in development projects, the empowerment model should serve as relevant communication form in any sustainable development. The examples of the Roma initiative may serve as a starting point for further understanding a given model of sustainable development communication, both in theory and in practice.

Overview Of Social Change Models

Since the late 1990s qualitative research and post-structuralism have enriched the scholarly works on development communication. Development communication endeavors to link the concepts of the southern hemisphere, development, and communication, together. At the beginning of the twenty-first century, the big questions are:

What do you do for us, to us, against us? Several current research-

177 Roma Project

ers base their theories on three major development models: modernization, critical/alternative, and liberation or empowerment theories (Melkote and Steves 2001). In the earlier understanding, development referred to social change, and communication was cited mainly in terms, as "the maintenance, modification and creation of culture" (Melkote and Steves 2001, 31). Nowadays, the goal is to achieve sustainable development that includes environmental and gender concerns along with critical cultural concerns.

Sustainable development communication uses mostly non-linear models based on intrapersonal, interpersonal, and group communication (that often includes organizational communication) together with consideration of local culture specifics (Mody 2003). Since in the long run, social change cannot be stopped or prevented, development refers to a directed and active social change within a community. It should not deny participatory communication, as communities are encouraged to exercise their right to discuss and include their own view on development of the objectives, imperatives, and methods (Huesca 2003b).



Modernization model

Briefly the modernization model and ideas are rooted in the colonization period. Originally, change in the Third World was to occur through exogenous factors with new ideas introduced from the outside - from the former colonizers. This mainstream development paradigm, prominent from the 1940s through the 1970s, is oriented around "progress measurement" via material, economic, and technological indicators. It promotes a dirigiste approach in which social change should be directed by the government bureaucrats, technological experts or technocrats, and the business elite of corporations (Melkote and Steves 2001). The research in this development positivism heavily relies on statistical data. Regarding the communication aspect, the weight of mass media is overwhelmingly high. Top-down communication is based on secular mass media with the official oppression of local religion or culture. In addition, few local ethical considerations are present. Development projects are initiated and mostly executed by international organizations (UN, WTO, IMF, World Bank) and national governments. Therefore, the

178 Eva Szalvai

context is macro or micro settings and the unit of analysis tends to be a nation (Melkote and Steves 2001).

Critical I alternative model

By the 1960s, even economists realized that the old modernization paradigm was not successful. Economic indicators clearly showed that this top-down, linear, Western model neither reduced Third World poverty nor promoted sustainable development (Black 2002). Interdisciplinary scholars from various fields of sociology, political economy, and communication, introduced critical theories on development such as the decentralization models, tricontinentalistic Marxist theories, cultural imperialism, and subaltern theories.

This critical paradigm, that included some of the postmodern research on gender, race, and class issues, has already intended to embrace spatial and cultural considerations in their analysis. Nevertheless, it was the work of Paolo Freire (1983) that caused a direct shift in the understanding of development communication.

Empowerment model

The deconstruction of the dominant paradigm was grounded on the discourse (Escobar 2000; Sosale 2002) and also included economic, sociological, and psychological deconstruction. Culture and community with religion, gender (e.g., Wilkin 2005), and environmental issues became the focal point of examination. In communication studies, more researchers viewed culture and communications as one, as modes of representation or meaning (Arnst 1996; Belbase 1994; Melkote and Steeves 2001). Place gained over space, local over global, and community, as unit became the focus of analysis. Power started to be viewed dialectically. Protest and social



movement became part of the idea of network societies. With this breach of global spaces, ordinary people started to gain voice and power for receiving and creating their own destiny. Such an approach aims to make local places alive, visible, and interconnected both with each other and the world. (Escobar 2000) A holistic view of culture is gaining place with the understanding of naturally interactive cultures and a-morph self-change. Therefore, the role of new develop-

179 Roma Project

ment communicators is to build trust cautiously while acquiring local knowledge and spurring the involvement of local people (Melkote, in-class communication, July 2006).

Freire's empowerment paradigm is based on a different educational approach. Dehumanization stems from power and humanity is stolen not only from the oppressed, but also from the oppressor. According to Freire, "the great humanistic and historical task of the oppressed" is "to liberate themselves and their oppressors as well" (Freire 1983, 29) as freedom is the "indispensable condition for the quest for human completion" (p. 31). In essence: "If men produce social reality ... then transforming that reality is an historical task, a task for men" (p. 37). Quite obviously he relates ethics to social change. Participatory communication becomes a necessity for such empowerment and change (Cadiz 2005; Huesca 2003b). The question then remains: how can power be shared following this new kind of social change? Since power is both created and exercised, institutions are needed that facilitate the paradigm of empowerment. Such an institution is The Open Society Institute.

Case Study Methodology

A large amount of detailed information is posted on the Internet regarding the activities of the Open Society Institute that includes submission guidelines for grants and scholarships, news on the various initiatives the OSI is engaged with, and reports on the progress of their projects. This case study is focused on the OSI's report and studies presented online on its Roma Initiative"

This analysis adopts an interpretive research method. It focuses on the discourse used by the OSI in these online communications such as studies, news, and reports, regarding its Roma project. Some of these studies are prepared by other organizations that are not directly affiliated to the OSI. Being a non-profit organization, the activities of the OSI are publicly monitored" Moreover, the OSI relies on extended network systems involving both vertical and horizontal relations with other large and small organizations across nations. Overall, the professional reports of the OSI were highly valuable for the critical analysis on development communication discourse in the Roma projects.

180 Eva Szalvai



Open Society Institute(OSI)

With years of hard work, the well-known billionaire, George Soros created a network of non-profit organizations (including a university) that currently is present in 29 countries and active in more than 60 additional countries. For example, the Open Society Initiative for Southern Africa (OSISA) and the Open Society Initiative for West Africa (OSIWA), are governed by regional boards of directors and staffs and provide grants in 27 African countries. The OSIWA and the OSISA foundations seek to "locate visions of open societies in their respective regions which serve to combat negative perceptions about Africa. The initiatives' strength lies in their roots in communities and countries that stimulate and create African solutions to African challenges" (Open Society Institute 2006).

The OSI offers a great variety of grants, fellowships, and scholarship for development purposes such as: grants for "enhancing coalitions of women's rights and HIV/AIDS organizations in select African countries;" scholarship that aims at the "equitable deployment of knowledge and communications resources for civic empowerment and effective democratic governance;" or a fellowship that "enables innovative professionals - including journalists, activists, academics, and practitioners - to work on projects that inspire meaningful public debate, shape public policy, and generate intellectual ferment within the Open Society Institute" (Open Society Institute 2006). These foundations are independent, autonomous institutions in their pursuit of open society activities as the "priorities and specific activities of each Soros foundation are determined by a local board of directors and staff in consultation with George Soros and OSI boards and advisors" (Open Society Institute 2006).

Theoretical Background of the

Open Society

Soros' life-long international work as a philanthropist is fundamentally based on Karl Popper's liberal democracy theory (1945) that defends the idea of a so-called Open Society. The idea of the open

181 Roma Project

society is partly rooted in the works of the philosopher Berson, who wondered how the government's role could be enhanced within the capitalist system" Disenchanted from the Marxist view of economics, Popper (1945) expanded the notion of open society as the adversary of totalitarianism in defense of democratic liberalism. Just as Popper, Soros - the "critical-rationalist" as he self-professed - not only defends a type of globalization based on open societies, but equally stands for the scope of intellectual influence" Clearly a reformist activist, his



theoretical approach to development and globalization rooted in his praxis (Soros 1994, 2000).

Apart from Popper, the theoretical thrust of Soros also relies on a modified version of Pierre Bourdieu's theory of practice (Bourdieu 1977). Endorsing Bourdieu's, reflexivity (Bourdieu and Wacquant 1992) - that social science researchers should be aware of their own interference with the research subject as the research objectivity of social sciences is always influenced by subjectivity of the researcher - Soros (1994) considers that events "are facts and observations that are true or false, depending on whether or not they correspond to the facts" (First section, para. 3). Thus, knowledge is incomplete, and this imperfect understanding of reality modifies reality itself, (Soros 1994). Rooted in years of experience in financial markets, Soros applies reflexivity in his philosophy and theories on economy. He believes that in an interconnected and interdependent world, societies should be open to the outside, allowing free flow of goods, ideas, and people; and open inside with free flow of thoughts and social mobility (Soros 2006). Overall, he recommends critical thinking through self-observation, reflection, and self-learning as responses to altered circumstances (Soros 2006).

In his global strategy, economic freedom is mingled with some governmental intervention through centralized economic planning in the field of environmentalism and social justice that may also include state ownership in the means of production" According to Soros (2003, 2006), well-established international laws could regulate private and government practices, while ensuring global justice and the civic society activities of cultures and nations" The Soros foundations clearly represent Soros' ideas on the open society while encouraging socially reflective and responsible actions. 1

Through the past 17 years, the Soros foundations have grown considerably and gained international attention. His primary

182 Eva Szalvai

foundation has disbursed over \$400 million annually in recent years (Open Society Institute 2006). In line with the philosophy and ideas of its founder, Soros, the mission statement of the OSI clearly states its interest in local initiatives. It also exhibits advocacy for some level of glocalization (Roberson 1992) while tying local and global interests together in a socio-cultural interdependency:

The Open Society Institute seeks to shape public policies that assure greater fairness in political, legal, and economic systems and safeguard fundamental rights. On a local level, the OSI implements a range of initiatives to advance justice, education, public health, and independent media. At the same time, the OSI



builds alliances across borders and continents on issues such as corruption and freedom of information.

The OSI places a high priority on protecting and improving the lives of marginalized people and communities. (Open Society Institute 2006)

Working with marginalized communities is among the main goals of the OSI. They are active in five sectors of social life: freedom and democracy; human rights; education; public health and access to care; and transparency and access to information. By targeting discriminatory practices and developing local Roma communities, the OSI's Roma Initiative aimed to aid the inclusion of the Roma diasporic communities in eight countries (Open Society Institute 2006). The research reported in this chapter matches the five targeted sectors with the activities of the Roma Initiative, and attempts to determine the development communication paradigms used in the process of these practices.

The OSI'S Path for Social Change:

The Romani Case

The OSI has worked for over 14 years with marginalization issues of the European Roma population. As such, the Roma Initiative was a social change project that targeted the situation of the Roma people (also called Romani or, commonly, "Gypsy"); it is one of the most controversial diasporic minorities in Europe. The Roma Initiative and its successor, the Decade of Roma Inclusion, is a

183Roma Project

cross-cultural longitudinal project that the OSI has worked for over 17 years.

Originally the Roma people originated from the Punjab and Rajasthan region of northern India. Their language, Romani, still maintains elements of Urdu that was commonly spoken in the region during the Persian Empire (Fraser 1992). They migrated away in retreat from the advance of Islam during the eleventh century. The Roma migrated across the Indian Ocean to the then Ottoman Empire and then on across the Mediterranean to the European Continent (Rishi 1976). They arrived in Central and Eastern Europe during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries on the coat-tails of incursions by the Ottoman Empire (Romani.org 2008).

Although they are referred to as "Gypsies" in English or "Gitanos" in Spanish, they prefer to be called as Roma or Romani (Romani.org 2008). The Roma culture holds to traditions and has difficulties adopting changes in social structure (Fraser 1992). Their cultural cohesiveness has faced overwhelming pressures through centuries by continuous persecution from empires and neighbors alike. Although they lost almost 500,000 people, they survived the ethnic cleansing of the Holocaust during the Third Reich (Crowe and Kolsti 1991). In 2007, the number of Roma people in Europe was estimated at ten million, of which around 80 percent live in



Central-Eastern Europe (OSI 2007).

The Roma people comprise Europe's largest trans-border ethnic minority (Rorke and Wilkens 2005). Their diasporic communities face strong discrimination - including racial and gender - practices that targets their way of life, belief system, social organization, and culture (Rorke and Wilkens 2005; ERRC 2008; Romani.org 2008). Unfortunately, the Roma people lost the social safety net offered by the socialist system. The fall of socialism in Central Europe in 1989 resulted in a worsening situation for the already marginal Roma people.

The Roma population's comparably limited prospects have barely improved over centuries of persistent stigma and discrimination on the part of the rest of the population, including governments at all levels in many parts of the country. Their overall economic situation arguably has gotten worse since the collapse of the Soviet era totalitarian regime, which tended at the very least to guarantee

184 Eva Szalvai

more jobs and a minimum level of support to all residents. (Hoover 2007, 36)

Another example is given by Will Guy, an OSI collaborator in Czechoslovakia, who observed that "the first tangible experience of this brave new world was not a sudden expansion of civic liberties but of harsh realities as any [Roma] were flung out of their predominantly manual jobs in the now virtually redundant heavy industries" (Rorke and Wilkens 2005, 8). It is mostly due to the aid of NGOs such as the OSI that the Roma situation gains public exposure and has the hope for social improvement and inclusion.

During the initiative, OSI employees cooperated directly with Roma individuals and community leaders in order "to help them mobilize their communities, to help themselves" (Rorke and Wilkens 2005, 4). Moreover, the OSI employs people with a Roma background in their projects in order to enhance culture proximity with targeted Roma communities (OSI Initiatives 2006). Employment affiliation with OSI projects also enhances the acceptance and credibility of Roma among people from the majority population (Rorke and Wilkens 2005).

The countries involved with the Roma Initiative are the so-called transitional societies. After the fall of the socialism in 1989, Central and Eastern Europe has been going through transition, consolidation, and expansion of democracy. Given the multi-country complexity, poisoned history and political sensitivity of the Roma situation, as well as their ingrained cultural stance as outsider-nomads, it is not surprising that only an NGO like the OSI would be well placed to tackle the trans-national nature of the issue.

The Roma Initiative is the OSI' s umbrella program for all its Roma-related efforts. The Initiative tries to assess and aid the change in the Roma people's situation in these transitional societies. The Initiative aims to



improve "the social, political, and economic situation of Romani populations while helping to build an indigenous Romani leadership" (OSI News 2005, 4). According to OSI News, more than \$34 million has been spent in 12 years on different Roma community projects within the program. The Roma Initiative fills an organizational vacuum, seeks to redress discrimination and offers innovative solutions based on the latest development communication techniques.

185 Roma Project

Summary of "current State"

Rom Situation

An OSI report, Equality for Roma in Europe: A Roadmap for Action, (OSI 2006) identified a number of factors that makes the work with Roma diasporic group more difficult and limit the progress of community development. Among these factors they reported the following: lack of strategic focus of funded initiatives; low levels of Roma participation in public life; insufficiently robust legislative frameworks; the need for an integrated approach; high levels of anti-Gypsyism; challenges to the preservation of Roma identity and culture; and lack of political will.

These factors clearly indicate a high level of discrimination and the lack of willingness to change from the ruling majority (OSI Initiatives 2006). Unfortunately, there are many examples of discriminatory practices. Among them we found stigmatization of Roma, discriminatory practices in the labor and capital (e.g, bank loans) market, segregated education system, insufficiency in health-care, and strong gender discrimination against Roma women.

Development Communication in the Roma

Initiative`s On Line Presentation

Development as discourse is "a set of interpretations that are structured through institutional statements about people, places, and problems" (Wilkin 2005, 199). Development communication discourse perpetuates the interest of agency, and is thus power-loaded. According to Wilkin (2005, 199), the "categories constructed through development discourse not only shape problems and those perceived to suffer from those problems, but also legitimize appropriate solutions." Studying the reports allowed me to interpret how the OSI assessed Roma people and their needs, and how these needs were addressed. The information obtained from the reports is also a good source for defining the OSI' s view on development and determining which development model is prominent in their practices.

186 Eva Szalvai



To begin with, the Roma Initiative counted on three major types of activities (Open Society News 2005, 4):

- 1 Part of the strategy of investing directly in Roma, the OSI offered support for Romani rights NGOs (e.g., European Roma Rights Centre, Roma Participation Program (RPP)) to combat discrimination and build alliances, particularly around the international Romani-led movement to desegregate schools.
- 2 The OSI's fellowships and its programs for women, children, and youth, in the fields of public health, media, justice, and education.
- 3 Pursuing fast and flexible grant making with a focus on the younger generation of activists and students; ensuring direct participation of Roma in project implementation, design, and evaluation; forging long-term partnerships based on coherent and sustainable strategies.

These activities accentuate participatory communication (PC), which is linked to the empowerment paradigm. Moreover, even development support communication (DSC) elements can be found in their educational approach and the Roma women's programs: the OSI supports Roma leadership in the abolition of local discriminatory practices in schooling and offers aid for the empowerment process of Roma women. "The categories constructed through development discourse not only shape problems and those perceived to suffer from those problems, but also legitimize appropriate solutions" (Wilkin 2005, 199).

Participation is a basic element in the empowerment model:

"People who are the objects of policy need to be involved in the definition, design, and execution of the development process" (Melkote and Steeves 2001, 333). The results illustrate that the OSI often uses the empowerment paradigm in its work with Roma people. Nevertheless, sometimes elements of the modernization (e.g., topdown communication) and the critical/alternative models are also present in their approach - mostly when they must deal with the interconnected communities, both locally and internationally.

Years of Rappaport's research defines empowerment as a "mechanism by which individuals, organizations, and communities gain control and mastery over social and economic conditions ... over

187 Roma Project

democratic participation in their community ... and over their stories" (Melkote and Steeves 2001, 355). The accentuation of this empowerment is used throughout the reports: "OSI's fellowships and its programs for women, children and youth, public health, media, justice, and education have also developed a wide range of initiatives to give Romani communities immediate assistance as well as empower them to secure their rights and end their marginalization" (Wilkins and Rostas 2005, 4), or "The Roma Cultural Participation Project supports the cultural inclusiveness and empowerment of Roma" (Rorke and Wilkins 2005, 12). Other reference shows



that any funding "should be ... guided by one simple criterion: whether in its intended or unintended consequences the initiative empowers Roma" (Rorke and Wilkens 2005, 6). These are good indicators that throughout the Roma development project the OSI intended to use the empowerment model.

Another important element of the empowerment model is participatory communication. According to Waters (2002, 91), participatory communication "stipulates that reflection and action should be guided by dialogue, that is communication that is democratic, collaborative, and open, geared toward the mutual engagement of social actors as equal subjects." Examining OSI online reports on the Romani cases (Open Society News 2005; OSI Initiatives 2006; Rorke and Wilkens 2005), the discourse clearly indicates elements of participatory communication. In the funding strategy approach the OSI included the need for "direct participation of Roma in program design, implementation, and evaluation" that clearly represents bottom-up communication during the project (Rorke and Wilkens 2005, 2). The same report points out the necessity of active involvement of Roma people in the projects: "substantive Romani involvement and partnership" (p. 5).

Participation in the Initiative was somewhat directed as the development projects had aimed to achieve certain goals such as improved education, liberation of women, or preservation of ethnic culture. Nevertheless, the Initiative relied mostly on the concept of Freire on conscientization. According to Freire's concept, it is necessary to facilitate the "conscientization of marginalized people globally of unequal social, political, and spatial structures in their societies" (Melkote and Steeves 2001, 339). We can observe such processes mostly in the educational and women-related projects. The OSI's

188 Eva Szalvai

trust in younger Romani activists who "possess the requisite skills to engage in grassroots campaigning as well as in international advocacy" (Rorke and Wilkens 2005, 5), also indicates the OSI's consideration for the active participation of local community members.

The OSI documentation also shows that the OSI stresses importance on constant dialogue with Roma communities. According to Freire "development communication should be practiced not as message communication but rather as emancipatory dialogue, a particular form of non-exploitative, egalitarian dialogue" (Melkote and Steeves 2001, 299). The OSI documentation claims that the success of the Roma development initiative "requires transcending conventional donor-recipient relationships and fostering dynamic partnerships with Romani civic organizations based upon trust, transparency, and reciprocity" (Rorke and Wilkens 2005, p. 5). One in particular, the major grant program, the Roma Participation Program (RPP) aims to "support Roma activism in Central and Eastern Europe to take charge of their lives, to participate in decisions that affect them,



and to advocate for their rights as equal citizens of their own countries" (OSI Initiatives 2006).

OSI documentation also shows that the OSI stresses importance on constant dialogue with Roma communities. According to Melkote and Steeves (2001, 299) "development communication should be practiced not as message communication but rather as emancipatory dialogue, a particular form of non-exploitative, egalitarian dialogue." OSI reports claim that the success of the Roma development initiative "requires transcending conventional donor-recipient relationships and fostering dynamic partnerships with Romani civic organizations based upon trust, transparency, and reciprocity" (Rorke and Wilkens 2005, 5). Working with marginalized communities and achieving fluid information exchange is always a delicate process. Understanding the culture and the marginalization of the Roma is particularly delicate in extreme problems, such as drug abuse.

Participatory communication and community empowerment involves not only the members of the targeted community but also the development agents. Importantly, the OSI makes special efforts to prepare its staff properly and enhance their ability for conducting dialogue with Roma people: "Organizations working with Roma need

189 Roma Project

to invest in staff training to ensure that their staff members are tolerant and unbiased" (Rorke and Wilkens 2005, 3). Participatory communication should be an educational process for the participants and for the researchers (Melkote and Steeves 2001, 338). As observed, educating the OSI employees is in accordance with participatory research. The role of the OSI employees involved with the Roma Initiative is collaborative as facilitators and activists. Creative solutions are necessary in order to ensure dialogue. Such a new initiative was the appointment of so-called "Roma health mediators" whose task is to improve the Roma community's access to comprehensive health care in Bulgaria.

Launched in 2004, the initiative focuses on training Roma individuals to serve as links or "bridges" between their own communities and local healthcare systems, which are almost unanimously staffed by non-Roma. The goal is to identify and overcome the numerous impediments - primarily cultural, but also economic and educational - that limit the inclination or ability of community members to seek out and obtain health care, particularly preventive care.

Mediators are trained to achieve these goals by focusing on both sides of the equation. On the one hand, they seek to raise awareness within Roma communities as to how, when, where, and why to place greater priority on health care. At the same time, they focus on improving providers' understanding of, sensitivity



to, and response to cultural differences between themselves and Roma. (Hoover 2007, 75)

This example underlines the efforts that the OSI makes to achieve dialogue and social change. Learning more about Roma culture can help to reduce - and ultimately eliminate - discriminatory views of people from the majority culture. Freire's notions of empowerment only can be achieved with such culture mediation.

Development should offer a chance for betterment (Black 2002).

Overall, the Roma Initiative aimed for the empowerment of Roma people, intended to achieve social justice for the Roma, and to help them to build capacity and equity. Unfortunately, the community development efforts were not as successful as expected. It is reported in the Open Society News: "Since the mid-1990s ... mobilization for political activity has come not from the grassroots but from what I'd call the middle class - the few Roma who were educated under the former communist regime, who had some schooling, who

190 Eva Szalvai

finished high school and entered universities" (Bitu 2005, 11). Future programs such as the Decade of Roma Inclusion, should concentrate on the creation of a larger platform of community activists.

Roma Inclusion Projects and Development Communication Models

All five sectors of social life that the OSI defined in its Mission Statement were represented through the various projects of the Roma Initiative.

Based on Melkote's comparative table on the theory of modernization and the empowerment paradigm (Melkote and Steeves 2001, 352), table 10.1 summarizes the different Roma projects indicating the type of development communication model used in these projects.

Participation is a basic element in the Empowerment model:

"People who are the objects of policy need to be involved in the definition, design, and execution of the development process" (Melkote and Steeves 2001, 333). Thus, advocacy for community issues formed part of the Roma Initiative. The Roma Participation Program (RPP) aimed for the civic and political participation of Roma people while promoting equality of Romani ethnicities. To achieve this goal, the OSI helped Roma people to promote local community activists offering "direct investment in Roma and Romaniled NGOs through strategic coherence combined with fast and flexible grant-making" (Wilkens and Rostas 2005, 4). RPP not only offered institutional support for these grass-roots Romani NGOs, but also got involved with training programs. The OSI strongly supported self-development initiatives.

Critical scholars such as Escobar, Mody, or Wilkin noted that "participation, without concomitant changes in



structural conditions, may not be efficient to foster substantive social change" (Wilkin 2005, 205). Therefore, the OSI's effort to work with conjunct communities and with larger- national and international- social structures is essential for the success of sustainable development in their Roma projects. The newly founded Romani NGOs aimed to achieve changes in the practices of ethnic communication